

THE USE OF DREAMS IN RIJAL BOOKS

Research Assist. Dr. Bekir KUZUĐIŐLI*

ABSTRACT

Although in general scholars accept that the dreams of persons other than those of Prophets are not sources of information, it can be understood that muslim scholars were not left out the dreams because of some hadiths dealing with the true dreams (ruya sâliha) and with the practice of the Prophet. They generally recorded these dreams in biographical sources. The aim of this article is to study on that these dreams on which kind of men and ideas are focused and on the reasons of these kind of dream narratives. Struggling between ahl al-hadîth and ahl al-fiqh that debated in the first three century, conflict between sects (madhâhip) and the matter of creation of the Qur'an (Khalqu'l-Qur'ân) are reflected on the transmitted-dreams. Thus, they want to prove that their group were right and the others were wrong by using the dreams that usually the Prophet were on vision.

ÖZET

RİCAL KİTAPLARINDA RÜYA KULLANIMI

Alimler, genel olarak, Peygamberler dışındaki şahısların gördüğü rüyaların bilgi kaynağı olmadığını kabul etmelerine rağmen salih rüyalarla ilgili hadisler ve bu konudaki Hz. Peygamber'in uygulamalarından dolayı onlardan mustağnî kalamamış ve ricâl kaynaklarında bir çok rüyaya yer vermişlerdir. Bu makalenin amacı ricâl kaynaklarında zikredilen rüyaların, hangi şahıs veya fikirler etrafında yoğunlaştığını ve bu tür rüyaların nakledilmesinin muhtemel sebeplerini araştırmaktır. İlk üç asırda uzun munakaşalara konu olan ehl-i hadis chl-i rey çekişmesi, mezhep mücadeleleri veya halkü'l-Kur'an meselesi etrafındaki gruplaşmalar söz konusu rivâyet edilen rüyalara da yansımış, zikredilen rüyalarla desteklenmek istenen grubun haklılığı, diğer grubun yanlışlığı ise çoğu ker Hz. Peygamber'e sorularak teyit edilmeye çalışılmıştır.

* Research Assist. Dr. of Hadith at Istanbul University.

In general, Islamic scholars have emphasized that information attained via dreams, other than those of the Prophets, have no scientific value. Although some scholars, including Abu Ishak Al-Isfirâyînî, claimed that dreams in which the Prophet is envisioned are binding and should be acted upon, this is not an idea that has been generally accepted; scholars have stated that dreams cannot act as proof of something and that they cannot lead to the establishment of a religious ruling.¹ For example, Ibn Hāzm (d. 456/1064) stated “Dreams kill theology, because one cannot be certain of their soundness. These could be illusions (*adghâthu ahlâm*). However, religious laws must sometimes speak of the soul, of honor or other important matters. These things cannot be dependent on a dream,” thus clearly putting forward this approach². Qadi al-‘Iyad (d. 544/1149) stated in clear language that a dream cannot change an established sunnah practice, nor can it put forward a practice as being sunnah that has not been established, and he recorded that the scholars were in agreement on this matter.³ In a similar manner, Shatibî (d. 790/1388) said that if a person who had a dream were to say something that was in keeping with an existing religious ruling then that person was within the religion. If they were to say something that was contradictory to the religion then it was impossible that they could be correct. This is due to the general acceptance of the principle after the death of Prophet Muhammad that the rules which he had established could not be effaced.⁴

The ruling as to why dreams should not be taken into account is explained by Ibn al-Hacc (d. 737/1336) as follows: 1) A person is not obliged with any duties while they are asleep. 2) Knowledge and reports (of hadiths) can

¹ Shavkânî, *Irshād al-fuḥūl*, p. 360; ‘Abd al-Kādir al-Badrān al-Dimashqî, *al-Madkhal*, p. 298.

² Ibn Hāzm, *al-Iḥkām*, VII, 407. Ibn Hāzm repeats this opinion in his other books, see: *al-Faṣl fī al-mīlāl va aḥvāi ve al-nīhal*, V, 14.

³ Qāḍî al-‘Iyāḍ, *İkmāl al-mu’lim bi fevāid-i Muslim*, I, 153.

⁴ Shāḫ ibî, *al-I’tisām*, I, 198. Cf. idem, *al-Muvāfakāt*, I, 82; II, 266; 267.

only be learned from someone who is fully conscious. 3) Prophet Muhammad commanded Muslims to obey two things: The Book and the Sunnah.⁵

Scholars who put forward views concerning dreams and actions based upon dreams stated that dreams that are contrary to legal rulings in particular carry absolutely no value and that legal rulings cannot be changed because of a dream.⁶ In this matter the following example is very striking: "A man living at the time of 'Izz b. Abd al-Salâm (d. 660/1262) saw the Prophet in his dream. The Prophet told him "There is some treasure buried in a certain place. Take it. But, you do not need to give one-fifth of it as charitable alms." The man uncovered the treasure and asked the scholars of the day if he had to give the alms or not. The scholars stated that the dream was reliable and therefore he did not need to give one-fifth away, as he had dreamed. However, 'Izz b. Abd al-Salâm claimed that the dream was invalid saying that it was in conflict with an authenticated hadith, "give one-fifth of the *rikâz*."^{7, 8} 'Ali al-Qâri (d. 1014/1606), who adopted this view, stated that "A dream should not contradict reported hadiths. If there is any such conflict then one cannot act according to the dream."⁹

In addition to the opinions of scholars recorded above, the statements found in the basic hadiths: "A reliable dream of a pious person is 1/46th of prophethood"¹⁰ and "Whoever sees me in their dreams truly sees me",¹¹ as well

⁵ İbn al-Hâcc, *Kitâb al-Madkhal*, IV, 292-293. (This information was quoted from Leah Kinberg's *Morality in the Guise of Dreams*, p. 37).

⁶ al-Nawawî, *Sharh al-Muslim*, I, 115. For scholars who follow this opinion see: Talat Sakallı, *Rüyâ ve Hadis Rivâyeti*, p. 35-50; Enbiya Yıldırım, "Beyhakî ve Hadis Rivâyetinde Rüyâ'ya Verdiği Değer", *Cumhuriyet Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi*, 5 (1), 2001, p. 171-172.

⁷ al-Bukhârî, "Zakât", 65.

⁸ al-Zurkânî, *Sharh*, II, 139; al-Laknavî, *al-Ta'liq al-mumaccad*, II, 141.

⁹ al-Laknavî, *ibid.* See also *al-Muvâfakât*, II, 266. İbn al-Qayyim, *Tehdhîb al-madâric al-sâlikîn*, p. 51.

¹⁰ al-Bukhârî, "Ta'bîr", 2, 4; Muslim, "Ru'yâ", 7; Abû Dâvûd, "Adab", 96; al-Tirmidhî, "Ru'ya", 1. For different numbers in this matter, see: Muslim, "Ru'ya", 9. For interpretations of different numbers, see: İbn Hâccar, *Feth al-Bârî*, XII, 362-363.

¹¹ al-Bukhârî, "İlm", 38; Muslim, "Ru'ya", 10.

as the fact that the Prophet asked the Companions about their dreams and interpreted them all mean that scholars could not ignore the matter of dreams. For example, al-Nawawî (d. 676/1277) reported that when the Prophet appears in a person's dream, ordering them to do good and to prevent evil all the scholars are in agreement that the person should act upon this dream.¹² In a similar way, Ibn Taymiyya (d. 728/1328), while explaining a matter of using weak hadiths in matters of virtuous actions, compared this to matter to that of dreams, in that they cannot introduce a ruling and cannot act as means for something to be considered lawful; he went on to state that they could be quoted as a means of *tergîb* and *terhîb* if they were within well-known bounds of the religion.¹³ As a result, therefore, the hadiths that are reported here serve not as evidence, but are rather reports of *isti'nas* and *istizhar* (encouraging people towards the religion and confirmation). At this point, after briefly examining the dreams that found in the basic hadith books we will go on to our actual topic, the use of dreams in the biographies.

A. The Use of Dreams in the Basic Hadith Books

When looking at the *basic hadith sources* it can be seen that, even though those hadiths that are concerned with dreams are proportionally few, they are either reported in connection with a matter of Islamic jurisprudence or in order to emphasize the reliability of a hadith. For example, concerning the hadith reported by al-Humaydî (d. 219/834), via Sufyân b. Uyayna, in which the Prophet is said to have been concerned about eating onions and garlic as these disturb the angels, it is reported that Suyfan had a dream in which he saw the Prophet and asked him "Oh, Prophet of God, it is reported that you did not eat things that people did not like. Is this true?" The Prophet answered him "Yes, it is true."¹⁴

¹² al-Nawawî, *Sharh al-Muslim*, I, 115.

¹³ Ibn Taymiyya, *Maṣmū' al-Fatāwā*, XVIII, 66.

¹⁴ al-Ḥumaydî, *al-Musnad*, I, 162.

In the books of Ibn Abi Shayba (d. 235/849), al-Bazzâr (d. 292/905) and al-Tahâvî (d. 321/933) a dream reported from Omar is as follows: "I saw the Prophet in my dream. But he was not looking at me. 'Oh, Prophet of God, what is wrong?' I asked. 'Even though you were fasting you kissed your wife,' he said. I answered him 'I swear that I will not kiss my wife while I am fasting.' The Prophet approved of this and said 'Yes'."¹⁵

As recorded by Ahmad b. Hanbal (d. 241/855), Ibn Mâja (d. 273/888), Abû Dâvûd (d. 275/889) and al-Nasâî (d. 303/915), after a hadith had been reported from Abû Ayyâsh, the narrator, Hammâd b. Salama, added the following: "A man saw the Prophet in a dream and said 'Oh Prophet of God, Abû Ayyâsh said that you gave this hadith,' quoting the hadith in question. In reply to this the Prophet said "Abû Ayyâsh is telling the truth."¹⁶

al-Tirmizî (d. 279/892) recorded that the hadith concerning *teshehhut* reported from Abdullah b. Mas'ud was the most genuine, and after confirming this with the opinions of scholars went on to quote a dream of Husayf. "I saw the Prophet in my dream and said 'People agree on the matter of the *teshehhut*.' He told me "Follow the *teshehhut* of Abdullah b. Mas'ud."¹⁷ 'Abdurrazzâk (d. 211/826) reported this dream before al-Tirmizî, as the last entry under the heading of "*teshehhut*".¹⁸

Alongside the evaluation of hadiths, it is possible to find a variety of interpretations by narrators that are either directly or indirectly related to nullification or modification in the *basic hadith sources*. Without a doubt, the

¹⁵ Ibn Abî Shayba, *al-Muṣannaf*, II, 315; al-Bazzâr, *al-Musnad*, I, 229; al-Ṭahâvî, *Sharh al-ma'ânî al-âthâr*, II, 88.

¹⁶ 'Aḥmad b. Ḥanbal, *al-Musnad*, IV, 60; Abû Dâvûd, "Adab", 100, 101; Ibn Mâja, "Du'â", 14; al-Nasâî, *al-Sunan al-kebir*, VI, 11. See also: al-Tabarânî, *al-Mu'jam al-kebir*, V, 217. It is said that the name of Abû 'Ayyâsh is Zayd al-Şâmit. But there is some doubt on this matter. (Ibn Ḥacar, *al-Iṣāba*, II, 610, IV, 412; 420; VII, 295).

¹⁷ al-Tirmidhî, "Şalât", 99.

¹⁸ 'Abd al-Razzâk, *al-Muṣannaf*, II, 205. For two more examples, see: al-Tirmidhî "Manâqib", 30, Cf. al-Mubâarakfûrî, *Tuḥfa al-aḥvazî*, X, 188; Abû Dâvûd, "Cenâiz", 16-17; Cf. al-Mizzî, *Tehdhîb al-kamâl*, XXXIV, 337.

most famous example of these is the interpretation from Muslim's *Sahih* in his *Mukaddime*, concerned with Ebân b. Ebî Ayyâsh. Muslim (d. 261/875) made clear in the quotation that he was not a reliable narrator, and then quoted Hamzâ al-Zayyât. "I saw the Prophet (pbuh) in my dream and I reported to him what we had heard from Aban. He recognized only 5 or 6 of the nearly 1,000 hadiths that I presented to him."¹⁹ It is noteworthy that a similar situation takes place before this in Ali b. Ca'd's *Musned*. It is recorded that the narrator of the dream that is found in *Musned*, Ali b. Mushir, said "I abandoned the hadiths from him when I heard this."²⁰

Abu Davud, after quoting a hadiths from his teacher Muhammad b. Muhammad b. Khallâd and saying that he had been wrongfully killed, recorded his own dream in the following way: "I saw him in my dream and said "How is God treating you"? He said "God has placed me in heaven". Then I said, "That means the *vakf*²¹ didn't cause you any harm."²²

The scholars who interpret the dreams that is recorded in the basic hadith sources, as was stated at the beginning of the article, claim that it is not permitted to use dreams as evidence. Al-Bazzâr, who reported the dream quoted from Omar above, said: "Omar reported from the Prophet the opposite of this statement," stressing that it could not be taken as evidence.²³ al-Tahâvî, who claimed that the hadith in question had been used by opponents as evidence, said "The events of the Prophet reported by Omar occurred in his sleep. These cannot be evidence." He also said that the opposite of this dream had been

¹⁹ Muslim, *Muqaddima*, 5.

²⁰ 'Ali b. Ca'd, *al-Musned*, I, 23.

²¹ In this context, the expression of waqf is understood as some one who says that the Qur'ân is the word of God and who is then silenced. Azîmâbâdî, the interpreter of Abû Dâvûd, understood it to mean that standing opposed to one's killers will not harm one ('Azîm âbâdî *'Avn al-ma'bûd*, IX, 105). However, this does not seem to be correct. As a matter of fact, having brought up the quotation mentioned above, Ibn Hacer, in his biography of Muhammad b. Muhammad, says that this "is about the Qur'ân" (Ibn Hacer, *Tahdhîb*, IX, 382).

²² Abû Dâvûd, "Eymân", 15.

²³ al-Bazzâr, *al-Musned*, I, 229.

reported from Omar.²⁴ Thus, this type of dream, which is recorded in the basic hadith sources, is accepted as a means of confirming rulings, and can be seen to facilitate their work by acting as exterior evidence to the laws in question.²⁵

On the other hand, one part of the dreams that are recorded in the *basic hadith sources* has been recorded by Ibn Ebi al-Dunyâ (d. 281/894) in his *Kitab al-Menamat* (Book of Dreams).²⁶ However, it can be understood that of the nearly 350 dreams²⁷ contained in this work, which we can expect will reflect the dreams recorded at that period, only a very small portion are also in the basic hadith sources. When examining the dreams recorded in *al-Menamat* or those not included in it, it can be seen that they are recorded more in the biographies and other works that relate to the deeds of leading personalities. The subject of dreams is truly a fascinating subject when one looks at the function they perform in the biographies and examines what kind of messages the author, the dreamer or the one who reports the dream wants to send.

B. The Use of Dreams in Rijâl Books

The compilers of histories or biographies of important people also included dreams, both positive and negative.²⁸ In fact, authors like Ibn Abî

²⁴ al-Ṭahāwī, *Sharh al-ma'ānī al-āthār*, II, 88-89.

²⁵ For an evaluation of the dream had about Ebān b. Abî 'Ayyāsh see: al-Nawawī, *Sharh al-Muslim*, I, 115; for the dream that Ḥammād b. Seleme transmitted see: 'Aẓīm ābādī *'Avn al-ma'būd*, XIII, 285; Sehāranfūrī, *Bedhl al-machūd*, XX, 18. For the dream that Khuṣayf transmitted see: Ibn Ḥacar, *Meṭālib al-'āliya*, VII, 188 (note of Critic). For an evaluation of the dream transmitted in Ḥumaydī's Musnad see: Ibn Ḥacar, *ibid*, V-VI, 535 (note of Critic).

²⁶ For the issue of Hz. 'Umar not kissing his wife while he was fasting, see: (Ibn Abî al-Dunyā, *al-Manāmāt*, p. 79); for the prayer of taṣahhud of 'Abd Allah b. Mas'ūd, see: (*ibid*, p. 82); for issues such as the eating of onion and garlic, see: (*ibid*, p. 83).

²⁷ The book of Ibn Abî al-Dunyā has two editions: 1. *el-Manāmāt*, Majdī Fethī es-Seyyid İbrāhīm, Qāhire, al-Maktaba al-Qur'ān, n.d.; 2. *Kitāb al-Manām*, Brill, Leiden, 1994. The editor of book, Eeah Kinberg, has published this work under the name *Morality in the Guise of Dreams: A Critical Edition of Kitābü'l-Manām with Introduction*, with many explanation.

²⁸ Fedwa Mali Douglas, "Controversy and its effects in the biographical tradition of al-Khaṭīb al-Baghdādī", *Studia Islamica*, XLVI, 1977, s. 126.

Hâtîm (d. 327/938), Qâdî al-'Iyâd, Ibn al-Jawzî (d. 597/1201), Dhahabî (d. 748/1348), Ibn Kathîr (d. 774/1373), Ibn Hacer al-Haytamî (d. 974/1567) and Taqiyuddîn b. 'Abd al-Qâdir al-Tamîmî (d. 1010/1601) had special sections devoted to dreams.²⁹ Other biographers, including Hatib el-Bagdadi, recorded dreams concerned with the narrators they were quoting. Below, the role that these dreams played in such works will be discussed.

***Cerh-Ta'dil* (Nullification or Modification) through Dreams**

In the biographies, while some narrations are translated, also some interpretations of dreams about the narrator in question or the hadiths that are being narrated are recorded. While these types of nullification and modification are sometimes directly related to a question about a hadiths or narrator, they are sometimes explained in such a way that the situation of the person in the other world is indirectly described.

a. Nullification and Modification Directly through Dreams

Some dreams that are reported in the biographies explain whether the person narrating is reliable or unreliable on a certain matter. In these types of dreams, the person either has a dream or is reporting a dream in which Prophet Muhammad or one of the leading hadith narrators is asked about a narration,

²⁹ Ibn Abî Hâtîm, *Taqdima*, al-Jarh va al-ta'dil, p. 119, 285, 311, 346 (For an evaluation of some of these dreams, see: Eric Dickinson, *The Taqdima of Ibn Abî Hâtîm al-Râzî*, p. 59-63); Qâdî al-'Iyâd, *Tertîbü'l-medârik*, II, 152 (Scholar's dreams that indicated Mâlik's knowledge and his scholarship); Ibn al-Jawzî, *Manâqib al-Imâm 'Aḥmad b. Ḥanbal*, p. 551 (Ibn al-Jawzî transmits three sections of dreams: Dreams had by 'Aḥmad. -p. 527-; dreams in which 'Aḥmad was seen -p. 529- and dreams about him -p. 551); al-Dhahabî, *Siyer*, XI, 344 (Dhahabî transmits dreams about 'Aḥmad b. Ḥanbal under the manâmât subheading); idem; *Manâqib Imâm Abû Ḥanîfa va Şâhibayhi Abî Yûsuf va Muḥammad b. Ḥasan*, p. 32 (Some dreams that herald to Abî Ḥanîfa); Ibn Kesîr, *al-Bidâya va al-nihâya*, X, 342 (Some dreams about 'Aḥmad b. Ḥanbal); Ibn Hacer al-Haytamî, *al-Khayrât al-ḥisân fî manâqib al-Imâm al-A'zam Abî Ḥanîfa al-Nu'mân*, p. 95 (Some dreams that Abî Ḥanîfa had and which were about him); Taqiyuddîn b. 'Abd al-Qâdir, *al-Ṭabaqât al-saniyye fî tarâjim al-Ḥanafîyya*, I, 146 (Some dreams that pious men had about Abî Ḥanîfa before and after his death).

and the narration is pronounced as trustworthy or weak. For example, a man had a dream in which the Prophet appeared and the Prophet asked him "From whom do you get your hadiths?" The man said "From Hushaym (b. Bashir)." The Prophet answered, "Take hadiths from Hushaym. He is a good man."³⁰ In a similar way, Muhammad b. Aslam et-Tûsî asks the Prophet from whom he should take his hadiths and is told to take them from Yahya b. Yahya et-Taymî.³¹ Moreover, dreams in which the Prophet was seen confirmed the narration of hadiths of Avza'î and Mansûr b. Mu'tamir on certain subjects.

In some examples an individual attains information by asking the Prophet about the relevant nullification or modification of a narrator. For example, a dream of Valid b. Muslim is reported as follows: "I had written down the hadiths of Abdullah b. Ziyâd b. Sam'ân. I fell asleep with the book in my hand. In my dream the Prophet appeared to me and I said 'These are the things that Ibn Sem'ân has narrated from you.' The Prophet said 'Tell Ibn Sem'an that he should not lie out of fear of God.'"³²

The dreams concerned with nullification and modification found in the biographies are not just dreams concerned with Prophet Muhammad. Although less frequently, there are dreams mentioned in which leading narrators of hadiths or sheikhs who reported hadiths appear in dreams in some situations. For example, Bishr b. Bekir records the following dream: "A few days after the death of Malik b. Anas he appeared in a dream. He told me: 'There is someone in your region called Ibn 'Abdilhakam. Take hadiths from him, he is reliable.'"³³ In another dream, Mucâhid appeared and was asked about a hadith which Leys b. Abî Sulaym had narrated from him and Mucâhid stated that he knew of no such hadith.³⁴

³⁰ Khatîb al-Baghdādî, *Tārîkh*, XIV, 93; al-Mizzî, *İbid*, XXX, 280; Ibn Hâcar, *Tahdhîb*, XI, 54.

³¹ Al-Nawawî, *Tahdhîb al-asmâ*, II, 454; al-Mizzî, *İbid*, XXXII, 35; Ibn Hâcar, *ibid*, XI, 260.

³² 'Uqaylî, *al-Duafâ*, II, 255; Ibn 'Asâkir, *İbid*, XXVIII, 283; al-Dhahabî, *al-Mizân*, IV, 101.

³³ al-Mizzî, *İbid*, XV, 193. For asking from Mâlik b. Anas about 'Abd Allah b. Vehb's situation see: *Kâmil*, IV, 203.

³⁴ 'Uqaylî, *al-Duafâ*, IV, 16; Ibn Hibbân, *al-Majrûhîn*, II, 232.

Some reports of dreams tell us that a narrator dreamed about a particular problem or that they were given more detailed information about a subject. For example, Ebu Nu'aym Fadl b. Dukayn, despite being a reliable narrator, was criticized for taking money for narrating a hadiths. Bishr b. 'Abdilvâhid describes the dream in which the former appeared as follows: "In my dream I asked Fadl 'What has God done to you for knowingly taking money for narrating a hadiths?' He answered me in the following way 'The judge examined the matter. He forgave me as I had a large family.'"³⁵ In a similar way Malik b. Anas asked about the position of Hishâm b. Urva and he was told that the hadiths reported by the latter in Medinah were sound, while those reported after he had left Medinah were to be considered as weak.³⁶

When the individuals whose expressions stating direct nullification or modification are examined, it can be seen that they are considered as trustworthy or weak according to the interpretations they have made; these are not related to their dreams. In other words, 'Hushaym, Yahyâ b. Yahyâ et-Teymî, Evzâî, Mansûr b. Mu'temir and İbn 'Abdilhakam are narrators who are considered to be trustworthy according to their interpretations, rather than dreams.³⁷ 'Abdullah b. Ziyad b. Sam'an, Leys b. Abu Sulaym are generally considered to be weak narrators.³⁸ On the other hand, despite not being trustworthy hadith narrators, the situations recorded above for Fadl b. Dukayn and Hisham b. 'Urva, are quite frequently quoted in the biographies.³⁹ Thus, it can be understood that dreams which present statements of nullification or modification that are in keeping with the norms are used as a means of confirmation and act as a means of verification for those who gave such rulings.

³⁵ al-Dhahabî, X, *Siyer*, 152; al-Mizzî, *İbid*, XXIII, 218.

³⁶ Ibn Abî Hâtim, *Taqdima*, p. 22; Ibn 'Abd al-Barr, al-*Tamhîd*, XXII, 120; Khatîb al-Baghdâdî, *Târîkh*, XIV, 40; al-Mizzî, *İbid*, XXX, 238; Ibn Hâcar, *Tahdhîb*, XI, 45.

³⁷ See respectively: Ibn Hâcar, al-*Taqrîb*, 574, 598, 347, 547, 310.

³⁸ Ibn Hâcar, *ibid*, p. 303, 464.

³⁹ For Fađl b. Dukayn see: Ibn Hâcar, *Tahdhîb*, VIII, 247; for Hishâm see: Ibn Hâcar, *ibid*, XI, 45.

In some dreams there is no mention of the nullification or modification of a narrator; rather they simply describe his place in the other world.

b. Indirect Nullification and Modification

In contrast to the statements of nullification given above, even though there may be no mention in some dreams of nullification or modification, the positive or negative condition of the person envisaged in the dream provides an idea for the reader. For example, Husayn b. Hurays b. Hasan, who had died while returning from pilgrimage, was envisaged in a dream wearing a white gown and a green turban while reading a verse from the Qur'an at the Prophet's pulpit, and the words "true, true" were heard rising from the surrounding graves.⁴⁰ In a similar manner, Hammad b. Seleme was envisaged in a dream and in reply to the question "How is your Lord treating you?" answered "He is treating me well."⁴¹ In a dream in which Hammad b. Zayd appeared he said that God had forgiven him, while Hammad b. Seleme was in the highest heaven (*alâ-i illiyyîn*).⁴² In addition to these examples, the fact that leading narrators of hadiths, like Sufyân al-Thawrî, 'Abdullah b. 'Avn, 'A'meş, Yahyâ b. Sa'îd al-Kattân, and other famous narrators⁴³ appeared in dreams depicted in a positive manner not only confirmed their reliability as narrators, but was also considered as a sign that the actions they carried out in this world were correct. At the same time, it can be understood that the reason why these individuals, who comprise

⁴⁰ Khatîb al-Baghdâdî, *Târîkh*, III, 108; al-Mizzî, *İbid*, VI, 361.

⁴¹ Ibn al-Jawzî, *Şifât al-Şafîva*, III, 363; al-Mizzî, *İbid*, VII, 268.

⁴² Abî Nu'aym, *Hilya*, VI, 252; al-Mizzî, *İbid*.

⁴³ For dreams about Sufyân al-Thawrî see: Ibn Abî al-Dunyâ, *Kitâbü'l-Manâmât*, p. 48, 57, 159, 162; Khatîb al-Baghdâdî, *Târîkh*, IX, 173; al-Mizzî, *İbid*, XI, 169. Ibn Abî Hâtim transmits dreams about Sufyân al-Sevrî under a special title. (Ibn Abî Hâtim, *Taqdîma*, p. 119). For a dream about 'Abdullah b. 'Avn see: Ibn Abî al-Dunyâ, *İbid*, p. 82; al-Dhahabî, *Siyer*, VI, 371; Ibn Hâcar, *Tahdhîb*, V, 304. For 'A'meş see: Ibn Abî al-Dunyâ, *İbid*, p. 52; Khatîb al-Baghdâdî, *Târîkh*, IX, 12; For Yahyâ b. Şa'îd Khatîb al-Baghdâdî, *Târîkh*, XIV, 142. For dreams about some other hadîth scholars see: Ibn Abî al-Dunyâ, *İbid*, 156-157, 166.

nearly all of the important narrators, are also represented as *ehl-i hadith* is due to their appearing in many dreams. We will return to this matter later.

On the other hand, it is noteworthy that those narrators who come to the fore as greats in Sufism, in worship or piety, appear in a positive manner in dreams. Alongside those narrators who lead the way in the biographies, there are those narrators who only provide a few hadiths; the reason why they are quoted is that they have made a positive appearance in dreams; sometimes in these types of dreams it is made clear that the person in question has reached a high rank due to their actions. For example, Raqaba b. Masqala related this dream about a leading hadith narrator, Sulayman al-Taymi: "In my dream I saw my Lord. He said 'I showed Sulayman al-Taymi great hospitality because he had prayed *fajr* prayer (morning prayer) with the ablution from 'isha prayer (night prayer).'"⁴⁴ Also, Bishr b. Haris (Bishr el-Hafi), from whom hadiths were reported by Abu Davud and Nasai,⁴⁵ is one of narrators whose dreams are most frequently quoted due to his piety and devoutness.⁴⁶ Narrators like Hassân b. Abû Sinân, Bişr b. Mansûr al-Sulamî, Murra b. Şarâhîl and Harûn b. Riâb come to the fore due to their piety and devoutness and also because they appear in a very positive light in dreams.⁴⁷

⁴⁴ al-Dhahabî, *Siyer*, VI, 197; al-Mizzî, *İbid*, XII, 10.

⁴⁵ Both authors transmit his hadîth in out of their *Sunan* (Ibn Hâcar, *Tahdhîb*, I, 389).

⁴⁶ In the biography of Bishr b. Hârith and in the other biography of transmitters relating to him there can be found many dreams. See, for instance, Khatîb al-Baghdâdî, *Târîkh*, I, 122; VII, 78-79; Ibn 'Asâkir, *Târîh al-Dimashq*, X, 224; al-Mizzî, *İbid*, IV, 109; XVIII, 501; See also, Ibn Abî al-Dunyâ, *a.g.c.*, p. 160; Abî Nu'aym, *Hilya*, VIII, 336; Ibn al-Jawzî, *Şîfat al-Şafîva*, II, 335.

⁴⁷ For a dream had by Hassân b. Abî Sinân see: al-Mizzî, *İbid*, VI, 28; For Bishr b. Manşur see: al-Dhahabî, *Siyer*, VIII, 361; For Murra b. Sharâhîl see: Ibn al-Jawzî, *Şîfat al-Şafîva*, III, 34; al-Mizzî, *İbid*, XXVII, 381; For Harûn b. Riâb see: Ibn Hibbân, *al-Thiqât*, VII, 578; al-Mizzî, *İbid*, XXX, 84. Ibn Abî al-Dunyâ, also, tells us some dreams that were had by pious transmitters: Ayyûb b. Miskîn (p. 66), Manşûr b. Zâdhân (p. 67), Abû Maysara (p. 70), Mâlik b. Dînâr (p. 76, 94, 130), Manşûr b. 'Ammâr (p. 120), Yûnus b. 'Ubayd (p. 121), Suvayd b. 'Amr al-Kalbî (p. 164), Şîla b. Ashyam (p. 150-151).

Consequently, the reliability of the narrators who are quoted has been consolidated by their positive appearance in dreams, and this acts as confirmation of what they have narrated.

In connection with this it is necessary to evaluate dreams in which narrators who lie, who are obsolete or unreliable appear in a positive light.

c. False-Obsolete Narrators and Dreams

Narrators of false or liars of hadiths who used a variety of means to enable their hadiths be accepted by society, often attempted to use dream materials. Some narrators report dreams that signify that they are a reliable or trustworthy narrator, while others try to support their weak or unlawful hadiths via dreams. For example, Muhammad b. Uqqasha, who was considered by many scholars to be a liar, claimed that he heard the words "Whoever makes complete ablution (*ghusl*) and reads the surah of Ihlâs 100 times will see the Prophet in their dream" from al-Zuhrî via Mu'aviya b. Hammâd al-Kirmânî; he stated that he kept to recite the surah for two years in order that the Prophet would appear to him in his dreams and that he would present the hadiths to him, and continued to proclaim this, adding that "In my dream the Prophet appeared as he was reported (...) I said to him "Oh, Prophet of God (...) I have some sunnah with me. I present them to you. He answered 'Fine' to me. (...) Later he told me to cling tight to these sunnah and he brought his fingers together." It is said that Muhammad b. Uqqasha had a sweet taste in his mouth when he awoke, and this continued for eight days as he took nothing to eat.⁴⁸

It is clear that Muhammad b. Uqqasha propounded such a dream so that the things which he claimed were sunnah would find acceptance among the people. However, the hadith *munekkids* did not accept these dreams and said that the narrator in question was a liar. For example, Abu Zur'a al-Razi, who we can understand knew about the dream in question, was asked about Muhammad b. Uqqasha; he shook his head and said that the latter was a habitual liar

⁴⁸ Ibn Hajar, *Lisân*, V, 287.

(kezzâb).⁴⁹ In a similar way, a dream related by Muhammad b. Nasr b. Harun was not accepted by hadith narrators.⁵⁰

On the other hand, the narrator 'Abbas b. 'Abdullah al-Tarqufi, who narrated from Ravvad b. Carrah, who in turn reported hadiths from particularly Sufyan al-Thawrî, whose hadiths were considered as unlawful (munker), tried to alleviate this negative situation by a dream that he had had. The hadith in question is reported to be recorded from the Prophet via Sufyan al-Thawrî > Ravvad b. Carrah, through 'Abbas b. 'Abdullah al-Tarqufi: "'The *hafifu'l-haz* will be the most blessed in the second century.' Those there asked 'O Prophet, who are the *hafifu'l-haz*?' he answered 'Those without family or children.'" After Abbas al-Tarqufî had reported this hadith it is said that he had a dream in which Sufyan al-Thawrî appeared and told him that the mentioned hadith had been accepted.⁵¹ However, despite this dream, Ravvad b. Carrah considered the hadiths from Sufyan to be in general unreliable, even saying that Ibn 'Adiy had quoted some of these as examples in his work.⁵² The hadith in question is considered by nearly all scholars to be a superstitious and illegitimate rumor (batil anda munker).⁵³

The hadith identified by 'Ali b. Asim, "He who visits the victim of a disaster will be rewarded to the same degree as he who suffered the disaster," has been the subject of many dreams. Despite this hadith being considered as unlawful by nearly all scholars,⁵⁴ there have been attempts to confirm it as trustworthy through dreams of the Prophet. According to one of these dreams

⁴⁹ Bardha'î, *al-Su'âlât*, p. 539; Ibn Hâcar, *Lisân*, V, 287. Ibn 'Asâkir transmits this dream before him (Ibn 'Asâkir, *Târîh al-Dimashq*, LIV, 232).

⁵⁰ al-Dhahabî, *al-Mîzân*, VI, 355; Ibn Hâcar, *Lisân*, V, 404.

⁵¹ Ibn 'Adiy, *al-Kâmil*, III, 176; Khatîb al-Baghdâdî, *Târîkh*, VI, 197; Ibn 'Asâkir, *Târîh al-Dimashq*, XVIII, 211. Cf: Leah Kinberg, "Dreams as Means to Evaluate ḥadîth", *JSAI*, (23), 1999, p. 93.

⁵² Ibn 'Adiy, *al-Kâmil*, III, 176.

⁵³ For an evaluation of the ḥadîth see: al-Munâvî, *Fayḍ al-Kadîr*, III, 497. See also. Ibn Abî Ḥâtîm, *Ulal*, II, 132; 'Uqaylî, *al-Ḍuafâ*, II, 69; al-Dhahabî, *al-Mîzân*, III, 83.

⁵⁴ For an evaluation of the ḥadîth see: al-Suyûtî, *Sharḥ Ibn Mâja*, I, 115; al-Mubârakfûrî, *Tuḥfa aḥvadhî*, IV, 158.

which was recorded by Hatip al-Baghdadi the Prophet was surrounded by the four caliphs and Ibrahim, yet he called 'Ali b. Asim to his side, kissed him on the forehead and said "Revivify my sunnah", saying that the relevant hadith was reliable.⁵⁵ Moreover, there are dreams that showed 'Ali b. Asim as being higher in heaven than Sufyan al-Thawri.⁵⁶

Consequently, dreams were manipulated in an attempt to have certain narrators and their sayings, which under normal circumstances would not have been accepted, accepted; however it can be understood that these attempts failed and such hadiths in general were still not accepted. In fact, some scholars have indicated that trying to find acceptance for a fabrication of hadiths by saying "I saw it in a dream" is as harmful, if not more so, than the normal fabrication of hadiths.⁵⁷

It can be seen that, in a way differing from the one recorded above, dreams were perhaps most often used in biographies in discussions about ideas and beliefs. Below we will examine the use of dreams in ideas and beliefs.

2. Discussions of Ideas and Beliefs in Dreams

Many of the dreams that are presented in the biographies can be seen to be concerned with arguments about ideas and beliefs. As well as the discussions of the *ehl-i sunnah*, *ehl-i bidat*, *ehl-i hadiths* and *ehl-i rey*, there is the matter of whether the Qur'an was created or not; the ideas and beliefs of the personalities who led this argument, as well as the leaders of the different groups above, as they appeared in dreams are dealt with in these books.

⁵⁵ For an evaluation of the hadith see: al-Suyuti, *Sharh Ibn Maja*, I, 115; al-Mubarakfuri, *Tuhfa al-ahvadh*, IV, 158.

⁵⁶ Ibn Abi al-Dunya, *Manamāt*, p. 159; al-Mizzi, *Ibid*, XX, 519.

⁵⁷ al-Munavi, *Fayd al-Kadir*, VI, 217.

a. Members of *Ehl-i Sunnah and Ehl-i Bidat* in Dreams

When the dreams that appear the biographies are examined, it can be seen that Sunnis are generally described in a positive way and the errors of those who are not of the Sunnis are emphasized. In particular, sects like the *Mutezile* and *Kaderi* appear in extremely bad dreams. A dream in which one of the leaders of the *Mutezile*, 'Amr b. 'Ubayd, was seen can be quoted as an example here. According to the report of Ibn Hibban (d. 354/965) a person had a dream where he saw a monkey coming out of a house and it was, said, "'Amr b. 'Ubayd."⁵⁸ According to another report in a dream 'Amr b. 'Ubayd was holding a Qur'an in his lap and he was scraping off a verse from there. He was asked what he was doing and he answered "I am changing this verse for a better one."⁵⁹ In another dream it was clearly stated that he was destined for hell. A man had a dream and he asked about the fate of leaders of Sunnis like Ayyub, Yunus and Ibn 'Avn. The person said that they were in heaven. When the dreamer inquired about 'Amr b. 'Ubayd it was repeated three times that he was in the flames.⁶⁰

Another person who is negatively described in dreams is Bishr el-Marîsî. Bishr, a person who frequently appears on the agenda in the matter of *halk al-Qur'an*, is one of those who were strongly criticized, even being accused of blasphemy, due to his other ideas concerning theology (*kalam*). There are many dreams that emphasis that he belonged to the *ehl-i bidat* given in the biographies. For example, Hatib al-Baghdadi, in his biography of Bishr al-Marisi, states that a man had a dream in which the devil appeared and told him that Bishr had carried out actions that the devil himself had been unable to do.⁶¹ The same author, in another example, said that a woman had been seen in a dream and after saying that God had forgiven her the dream continued with the dreamer asking the woman "Well, then why is your face red?" The woman said that someone called Bishr al-Marîsî had been buried next to her and that the

⁵⁸ Ibn Hibbān, *al-Majrūhīn*, II, 71. For a similar dream see: Ibn 'Adiy, *al-Kāmil*, V, 106.

⁵⁹ Ibn 'Adiy, *al-Kāmil*, V, 97.

⁶⁰ Ibn 'Adiy, *al-Kāmil*, V, 99; Ibn Hācar, *Tahdhīb*, VIII, 64.

⁶¹ Khaṭīb al-Baghdādī, *Tārīkh*, VII, 64.

fires of hell had suddenly flared up around him. "The fire caused my face to become red," she answered.⁶²

On some occasions there have been attempts to prove that the dreams about *ehl-i bidat* were correct by stating that the events in the dream came about the next day, or very soon afterwards. For example, Ibn Sam'ân envisaged two dogs in his dream; he was able to calm one down, but he could not calm the other. A few days later two *ehl-i bidat* came to him. Ibn Sam'ân called them to the Sunni way. One of them accepted, while the other turned his face away.⁶³ Well-known personalities do not escape from being seen in such dreams. For example, 'Abdulazîz b. Muhammad el-Daravardî fell asleep in a masjid and had the following dream: "In my dream a man came into the masjid with a rope in his hand; he tied the rope around the neck of a donkey and took it outside. Before much time had passed a man came into the masjid and put a rope around Ibn Ishak's neck, and took him to the Sultan." Al-Zubeyri said that this was the result of his views on fate.⁶⁴ The Ibn Ishak here is the famous Ibn Ishak who was a compiler of *Sîre*. It is clear that both narrators wanted to prove the reliability of their dreams by saying that the events had later happened.

Apart from the examples above, dreams like that of Abu Amr b. 'Alâ where he heard "Whoever resides in Baghdad according to the sunnah and the jamaat will be transferred from one heaven to another,"⁶⁵ the words in the dream of Abu Omar al-Darfîr that the most evil people were those of the *Kaderi*, *Mutezile*, and *Murci*,⁶⁶ and the one about Amr b. Faid al-Asvari, who was named as being a member of the *Mutezili* and the *Kaderi*, in which his bed appeared as if a camel's stable at the same time that a verse from the Qur'an

⁶² Khatîb al-Baghdâdî, *Tārîkh*, XIV, 433.

⁶³ Ibn Abî al-Dunyâ, *ibid*, p. 152; Ibn 'Asâkir, *Tārîh al-Dimashq*, XXVIII, 282.

⁶⁴ Ibn 'Adiy, *al-Kâmil*, VI, 107; Khatîb al-Baghdâdî, *Tārîkh*, I, 225; al-Mizzî, *ibid*, XXIV, 419.

⁶⁵ This hadîth also stresses the virtue of Baghdâd (Khatîb al-Baghdâdî, *Tārîkh*, I, 46).

⁶⁶ Ibn Abî al-Dunyâ, *Kitâbü'l-Manâm*, p. 130 (Brill edition).

about unbelievers was being recited,⁶⁷ can all be seen to be used for the same purposes.⁶⁸

Some people, although they were considered to follow the lines of Sunni Muslims, were criticized through dreams because of their ideas. For example, Shababa b. Sevvar, from whom all the compilers of *Kütüb-i Site* had taken their hadiths, was generally considered to be a reliable narrator; in his biography a dream of someone from the city of Medain is related concerning him: "I saw a well-dressed aristocratic person in my dream. He asked me where I was coming from. I said from al-Medâin. 'Is that not the city in which Shababa lives?' I said 'Yes' (...) The man cursed him, saying, 'If Shababa dislikes the family of the Prophet, let him be immediately stricken.' He continued, 'Say "âmin" for this'" The dreamer later awoke and went to Medain and reported that Shababa had had a stroke during the hours when he had been dreaming.⁶⁹

According to the descriptions in the biographies, some narrators had at first adopted *ircâ* ideas which they later abandoned due to dreams. For example, in the biography of Mus'ab b. al-Miqdam al Has'ami he explains how when he envisaged a cross on his neck he abandoned his reactionary ideas.⁷⁰ In contrast to this event Ali b. Suhayl al-Sicistânî, who was a *Murci*, was asked to abandon his ideas. He replied that he would not change his regressive opinions, even though he had dreamed about Ahmad b. Hanbal on the Day of Judgment and that the latter was handing out rings.⁷¹

On the other hand, Abu Hanîfa, seen as a leader of *ircâ* ideas, was the subject of many bad dreams. For example, al-Fasavî (d. 277/890), after giving place to the claims that he was a *Murci* and a *Cehmi*, quoted this dream: "In my dream there was a funeral. There was a black cloth over the casket, and there

⁶⁷ 'Uqaylî, *al-Duafâ*, III, 290.

⁶⁸ For other examples see: Ibn Abî al-Dunyâ, *al-Manâmât*, p. 136; Ibn 'Adiy, *al-Kâmil*, III, 430; Khaţîb al-Baghdâdî, *Târîkh*, VIII, 110; al-Mizzî, *İbid*, XXVI, 469.

⁶⁹ Ibn Hâcar, *Tahdhîb*, IV, 264.

⁷⁰ al-Mizzî, *İbid*, XXVIII, 45; Ibn Hâcar, *Tahdhîb*, X, 150.

⁷¹ It is clear that this dream also praises 'Ahmad b. Hanbal' because it is transmitted by al-Mizzî in the biography of 'Ahmad (al-Mizzî, *İbid*, I, 401).

were priests all around. 'Whose funeral is this?' I asked. They told me that it was Abu Hanîfa's."⁷² In a dream quoted by Ibn Hibbân, Abu Hanîfa was described by Abu Bakr, "Oh people, here is the man who has changed Muhammad's religion."⁷³ On the other hand, Ibn 'Adiy, in the translation of Abu Hanîfa, reports the dream of another: "In my dream I said, 'O Prophet of God tell us from whom we should get hadiths?' He answered 'Sufyan al-Thawrî.' I asked 'What about Abu Hanîfa?' He answered me 'He is not one to take knowledge from.'⁷⁴ Hatib repeated dreams of the same subject and gave space to negative dreams in addition to the ones quoted above.⁷⁵

However, it cannot be said that there are negative dreams about all the narrators who are defined as *Murci*. For example, because of the *ircâ* ideas of Mis'ar b. Kidam, Sufyan al-Thawrî did not participate in the former's funeral, but in the opinion of the hadith collectors Mis'ar b. Kidam was a reliable and trustworthy narrator; all the dreams about him were positive. Such good dreams were, for example, one in which, because of the *dhikir* gatherings, he was forgiven by God;⁷⁶ there is a dream recorded that when Mis'ar b. Kidam died the inhabitants of heaven gave the Prophet the glad tidings,⁷⁷ and there were dreams in which he was in heaven.⁷⁸ In a similar way, Ibrahim b. Tahman, accused by Ahmad b. Hanbal of being a *Murci* and *Cehmi*, but whose hadiths were considered reliable, was envisaged in a dream as sitting next to the truthful ones, and being visited by Ibn al-Mubâarak and Sufyan al-Thawrî.⁷⁹ On the other hand, Abu Muti al-Balhî, who was found to make some refutations (*jarh*), despite being accused of being a *Murci* and a *Cehmi*, was described as having

⁷² al-Fasavî, *al-Ma'rifa wa al-Târîkh*, III, 96.

⁷³ Ibn Hibbân, *al-Majrûhîn*, III, 66; Ibn Hibbân, *al-Thiqât*, IX, 70. See also: Ibn 'Asâkir, *Târîh al-Dimashq*, LIII, 283.

⁷⁴ Ibn 'Adiy, *al-Kâmil*, VII, 10.

⁷⁵ For dreams in the *Târîkh al-Baghdād* see: XIII, 425, 440, 441, 454.

⁷⁶ Ibn Abî al-Dunyâ, *al-Manâmât*, p. 60.

⁷⁷ Abî Nu'aym, *al-Hîlya*, VII, 209; al-Mizzî, *îbid*, XXVII, 468.

⁷⁸ Ibn Abî al-Dunyâ, *ibid*, p. 155.

⁷⁹ Khaṭîb al-Baghdādî, *Târîkh*, VI, 110.

been forgiven by God.⁸⁰ In this way, Abu Hanîfa described in an extremely negative way in some dreams not only because he was a *Murci*, but also because he was a leader in these ideas.⁸¹

b. Arguments about *Ehl-i Rey* and *Ehl-i Hadiths* in Dreams

Here, rather than discussing *ehl-i hadiths* and *ehl-i rey*, the jurisprudential tendencies are examined. When one examines the biographical sources, it is striking that the dreams that are concerned with the relevant arguments generally contain scenes that depict the *ehl-i rey* in a negative manner. Moreover, it can be seen that some scholars who were later to become famous joined the *ehl-i rey*, abandoning the dealing with *rey* because of their dreams. For example, Qutayba b. Sa'id dealt with *rey*; one day he had a dream in which a water container was hanging down from the sky. People were trying to take hold of it, but they could not. Qutayba b. Sa'id says then that he went and took the container and added that the water covered the east and the west. Qutayba took this dream to someone for interpretation, and this person said "Leave *rey* behind, and focus on hadiths. *Rey* cannot cover the gap between the east and the west." Qutayba abandoned *rey* in accordance with this dream and recorded that he began to learn hadiths.⁸² On the other hand, as Ahmad b. Muhammad b. Isâ acted according to hadiths and works he appears in dreams as being praised.⁸³ Rabi'a al-Ray, despite going to heaven, was warned for taking too much interest in *rey*.⁸⁴

⁸⁰ Khatîb al-Baghdādî, *Tārîkh*, VIII, 224.

⁸¹ In addition to Abî Hanîfa, Abâ Yûsuf also was seen in this kind of negative dream. For example, 'Uqaylî recorded that he was seen in a dream praying not towards the Qibla and in another dream he was carrying a cross ('Uqaylî, *al-Ḍuafâ*, IV, 438).

⁸² Ibn 'Adiy, *Man revâ 'anhum al-Bukhârî fî al-Saḥîb*, p. 225; Khatîb al-Baghdādî, *Tārîkh*, XII, 467; al-Dhahabî, *Siyer*, XI, 17; al-Mizzî, *İbid*, XXIII, 530.

⁸³ Khatîb al-Baghdādî, *Tārîkh*, V, 61

⁸⁴ 'Irâqî, *al-Taqyîd va al-İdâh*, p. 455.

It can be seen that Abû Hanîfa and his friends, al-Imâm Mâlik and al-Shafiî, came to the fore in dreams concerned with the argument between the *ehl-i rey* and *ehl-i hadiths*. In such dreams, while al-Imâm al-Shâfiî is portrayed in a positive light in nearly every dream, in some Malik receives warnings, while Abu Hanîfa is criticized to a greater extent. A dream reported by Abu Nu'aym from Muhammad b. Ahmad b. Nasr sheds some light on the idea recorded above: For a long time he had written about the ideas of Malik, and after he expressed his negative opinion of al-Shafiî, he goes on to say "In my dream I saw the Prophet. 'Oh, Prophet of God, should I record Abu Hanîfa's opinions?' I received a negative reply. 'Well, then should I record Malik's opinions?' I said. 'Write those that are in agreement with my hadiths,' he said. 'Well, what about Al-Shafiî's opinions?' I said. The Prophet acted as if angered by my words and shook his head, and said 'They are not opinions, they are refutations of the opponents of my sunnah,' he said. Muhammad b. Nasr then woke up and reports that he went to Egypt to write up al-Shaffiî's works.⁸⁵ Another report that is recorded by Hatib is that the Prophet said "I do not know who Abu Hanîfa is."⁸⁶ In another dream the Prophet was asked about Malik, Abu Hanîfa, al-Shafiî and their friends; "Only my words are valid" he said, and on the matter of al-Shafiî and friends he added "His words are the opposite of the *sâhibu bid'at*."⁸⁷ On the other hand, it is recorded that Imam al-Shafiî dreamed about Abu Hanîfa in which he was wearing a dirty and untidy garment and said "It is none of your business."⁸⁸

In the earlier period some dreams that praise Abu Hanîfa can be found in the *ehl-i hadith* sources. For example, Abu Hanîfa reports: "One day in my dream it was as if I were digging the Prophet's grave. Later, when I arrived in

⁸⁵ Abî Nu'aym, *Hilya*, IX, 100; See also: Khatîb al-Baghdâdî, *Târîkh*, I, 365; This dream is repeated in the biography of al-Shâfiî (Khatîb al-Baghdâdî, *Târîkh*, II, 69); Ibn 'Asâkir, *Târîh al-Dimashq*, LI, 422, 423; Al-Nawawî, *Tahdhîb al-asmâ*, I, 108; al-Dhahabî, *Siyer*, X, 43.

⁸⁶ Khatîb al-Baghdâdî, *Târîkh*, IV, 230; Ibn 'Asâkir, *ibid*, LI, 424.

⁸⁷ Ibn Abî Hâtîm, *Adab al-Shâfiî*, p. 72-73; Ibn 'Asâkir, *ibid*, LI, 423.

⁸⁸ Ibn Abî Hâtîm, *ibid*, p. 174. For some negative dreams about Abû Hanîfa see: Leah Kinberg, "The Legitimization of the madhâhib through dreams", *Arabica*, XXXII, 1985, s. 50-52.

Basra I asked Ibn Sirin about my dream. He answered him "The person who had this dream will explain the meanings of news from the Prophet."⁸⁹ Another report, recorded by Ibn Abu al-Dunyâ, states that Abu Hanîfa said "I am in prosperity" but indicated that Sufyân al-Thawrî was at a higher state.⁹⁰ This dream, no matter how much it may seem like a positive dream about Abu Hanîfa according to the paragraph quoted above, still shows him at a lower level than Sufyan al-Thawrî, the representative of his *ehl-i hadiths*.

A few of the positive dreams that are found in the *ehl-i hadiths* sources in the earlier period continue in the later period. Despite not having a connection with the Hanefî sect, reporters of hadiths like al-Nawawî, al-Dhahabî, al-Mizzî and al-Haytamî⁹¹ not only keep in silence about statements on Abu Hanîfa, but also eliminated the negative dreams about him in general.⁹² Naturally, Hanefî scholars also quoted prophetic dreams about their imams in their Tabakât works.

When one looks at the dreams that are in favor of Abu Hanîfa found in this type of source it can be said that they have the quality of being answers to the dreams quoted in the *ehl-i hadiths* books of the earlier period. For example, it is reported that knowledge should not be taken from Abu Hanîfa while in the same source the Prophet also praises Abu Hanîfa's knowledge.⁹³ In contrast, in response to the bringing to the fore of Sufyan al-Thawrî, the most important representative of *ehl-i hadiths* in Kufe, in Sarî b. Talha's dream Abu Hanîfa is described in this manner: "I saw Abu Hanîfa when he was sitting somewhere. I asked him 'Why are you sitting here?' He said, 'I come from the presence of my

⁸⁹ Khatîb al-Baghdādî, *Tārîkh*, XIII, 334. Khatîb transmits some dreams with the same meaning. In the transmission that comes from al-Şaymarî, Ibn Sîrin says: "This man will spread knowledge as no one had done before (Khatîb al-Baghdādî, *İbid*).

⁹⁰ Ibn Abî al-Dunyâ, *İbid*, p. 167.

⁹¹ al-Nawawî, *Tahdhîb al-asmâ*, II, 503; al-Mizzî, *İbid*, XXIX, 427; al-Dhahabî, *Siyer*, VI, 398, *Menâkîb al-İmâm Abî Hanîfa*, p. 32-33; Ibn Hâcar al-Haytamî, *el-Khayrât al-ḥisân*, p. 96-97.

⁹² For a comprehensive evaluation see: Ibn 'Abd al-Barr, *al-Intiqā fî faḍā'il al-aimma al-thalātha al-fuqaḥā*, p. 241 ((note of critic 'Abd al-Fattāḥ Abū Ghudda).

⁹³ Ibn Hâcar al-Haytamî, *İbid*, p. 96-97; Taqiyuddîn b. 'Abd al-Qâdir, *el-Ṭabaqât al-saniyya*, I, 146-147.

Lord. I got my rights from Sufyân al-Thawrî."⁹⁴ In another dream, it is stated that three stars fell from the sky in order of degree; the first was Abu Hanîfa, the second was Mis'ar (it is stated above that he adopted ircâ ideas) with the third being Sufyan al-Thawrî.⁹⁵ On the other hand, al-Haytami spoke of a dream in which Abû Hanîfe was on the Prophet's left and the Prophet turned to him and recited a verse about the infidels, while on his right was al-Shafii and the Prophet turned to him and recited a verse about the believers. After stating that this dream was not reliable he reports another dream in an attempt to prove this. In the second dream, it is emphasized that both the imams were on the right path, and even that a person had had a dream in which they asked the Prophet about the dream quoted above; the Prophet replied that he had never said any such thing.⁹⁶ In some dreams it is stated that Abu Hanîfa would be forgiven because of the negative things people had said about him.⁹⁷

In both the earlier and the later periods it can be said that dreams were recorded praising Malik b. Anas, and that there are no negative messages about the *ehl-i rey*.⁹⁸ In general it can be understood from this type of dream, even when the leading representatives of *ehl-i hadiths*, like Malik b. Anas, al-Shafîi and Ahmad b. Hanbal, are depicted as being in heaven⁹⁹ that the true argument about Abu Hanîfa and al-Shafîi took place among the *ehl-i hadiths* and the *ehl-i rey*. It could be said that the most famous representatives of the *ehl-i hadiths*, Ahmad b. Hanbal, appears in dreams mostly due to the matter of the *Halk al-Qur'an*.

⁹⁴ al-Şaymarî, *Akhbâr Abî Hanîfa va aşhâbuh*, p. 68; Taqiyuddîn b. 'Abd al-Qâdir, *İbid*, I, 147.

⁹⁵ Ibn Hâcar al-Haytamî, *İbid*, p. 96.

⁹⁶ Ibn Hâcar al-Haytamî, *İbid*, p. 98.

⁹⁷ Mar'î b. Yûsuf al-Karmî, *Tanvîr başâir al-muqallidîn*, p. 102.

⁹⁸ There are some exceptions. For instance, because of a dream he had, Qâdî al-'Iyâd mentions a man who converted from the Hanafî sect to the Mâlikî sect (Qâdî al-'Iyâd, *Tartîb al-madârik*, II, 157); For dreams which were about Mâlik b. Anas see, also.; Leah Kinberg, "Madhâhib", s. 53.

⁹⁹ Abû Ya'îa al-Khalîli, *al-Irshâd*, I, 284; Qâdî al-'Iyâd, *al-Tartîb*, II, 151; al-Mizzî, *İbid*, XIX, 103.

c. The Matter of *Halk al-Qur'an* in Dreams

In the biographies many dreams are recorded concerning the matter of whether the Qur'an was created or whether it had always existed. Generally, those who say the Qur'an was created, either with a few general expressions or by quoting the ideas of the leaders in this matter, meet with a bad end in these dreams. For example, in a dream the Prophet was envisaged next to Abu Bakr and the Prophet said the following: "Some of my *ummah* have sprouted up and they say 'My Lord's utterances are created'. Do not speak with them, do not sit next to them, do not pray for them and do not join in their funerals."¹⁰⁰ In another dream, those who adopted the idea that the utterances in the Qur'an were the eternal word of God would have a gold ruby ring attached to their eyebrow, they would be placed in heaven and they would be forgiven; those who said that the Qur'an was created would have their right side turned into a monkey, they would live one or two days like this and then they would be thrown into hell.¹⁰¹

In connection with this is the subject in which the leaders of the idea that the Qur'an was created are seen in a negative manner in dreams. For example, there are dreams in which the Prophet shows Mutezilî Ibn Abu al-Duâd and recites a verse concerning infidels, there are dreams in which it is stated that he would be of those who would meet God's wrath or that God had left him dumb as an indication for people, as well as there being dreams in which he is turned into other creatures.¹⁰² In contrast to this it was said that Ahmad b. Hanbal, who himself had had a dream in which it was said that he would be tested on the matter of the creation of the Qur'an, was seen at a high rank on the level of God and that God and the angels were pleased with him, also everyone who had opposed him would be subject to the wrath of God and he would be allowed to intercede for those people at the gates of heaven who testified that the Qur'an is

¹⁰⁰ Khatîb al-Baghdâdî, *Tārîkh*, VII, 176.

¹⁰¹ Khatîb al-Baghdâdî, *Tārîkh*, IV, 154.

¹⁰² All of these were transmitted by Khatîb (*Tārîkh*, IV, 153-156). See also: Ibn al-Jawzî, *Manâqib*, p. 539; Ibn Kasîr, *al-Bidāya va al-nihāya*, X, 343.

the word of God.¹⁰³ Moreover, Ahmad b. Nasr b. Malik, who refused to accept that the Qur'an was created and who was hung for this, was seen in many positive dreams.¹⁰⁴

In the rijâl sources there are some negative dreams reported about those who thought, despite being members of *ehl-i hadis*, that the Qur'an was not created but remained quiet (*vakîfî*) or those who accepted that the Qur'an was created out of fear of punishment. For example, Isma'il b. Ulayya, a reliable person according to the hadiths scholars, appeared in a dream with a black face.¹⁰⁵ Ali al-Madini saw Prophet David preaching from his pulpit and he wished he had seen Job, because when Job was alive he had been tried with his physical being while Prophet David had been tried with the instigation of the people. The narrator says "And then what happened happened," interpreted by Hatîb to mean that the "matter of the *halk al-Qur'an* was accepted by Ali b. al-Madini."¹⁰⁶ It is reported that Ishak b. Abu Isra'il, who, although considered a reliable narrator, was said to be a "Bad Vâkîfî" by Ahmad b. Hanbal, was warned by the Prophet in a dream about his point of view.¹⁰⁷ When one takes into account this dream one can understand why Abû Dâvûd included this hadiths in his work *Sunen* about the matter of the *vakf* of his teacher Muhammad b. Hallad, as the latter is not in opposition to this dream.¹⁰⁸

As well as the *halk al-Qur'an* matter, it is possible to find other dreams concerned with another matter that was being discussed at the same time. In opposition to the *Mutezile* thesis that God would not be seen in the hereafter, it is particularly emphasized that some people of the *ehl-i sunnah* looked on the face of God. For example, it is reported that in a dream God asks Ahmad b.

¹⁰³ All of these dreams were transmitted by Ibn al-Jawzî (*Manâqib*, p. 551-571).

¹⁰⁴ Khatîb al-Baghdâdî, *Târîkh*, V, 179-180; Ibn al-Jawzî, *Şifât al-Şafwa*, II, 365; al-Mizzî, *İbid*, I, 512-513; al-Dhahabî, *Siyer*, XI, 168.

¹⁰⁵ al-Fasavî, *İbid*, II, 80; Khatîb al-Baghdâdî, *Târîkh*, VI, 238; al-Dhahabî, *al-Mîzân*, I, 376, *Siyer*, IX, 112.

¹⁰⁶ Khatîb al-Baghdâdî, *Târîkh*, XI, 466; al-Mizzî, *İbid*, XXI, 21.

¹⁰⁷ Khatîb al-Baghdâdî, *Târîkh*, VI, 361; al-Mizzî, *İbid*, II, 404.

¹⁰⁸ Abû Dâvûd, "Aymân", 15; Ibn Hâcar, *Tahdhîb*, IX, 382.

Hanbal, "O Ahmad, were you punished for my sake?" he answered "Yes". He then received the answer: "This is my appearance; I give permission for you to look on it."¹⁰⁹ It is noteworthy that there were some other members of the *ehl-i sunnah*, other than Ibn Hanbal, who looked on the face of God.¹¹⁰

3. Evaluation and Conclusion

Although in general scholars accept that the dreams of persons other than those of Prophets are not sources of information, it can be understood that muslim scholars were not left out the dreams because of some hadiths dealing with the true dreams (*ruya salihah*) and with the practice of the Prophet. There is no doubt that the place where these dreams are recorded the most are in the biographical sources.

What must be looked at first when studying the dreams in the biographical sources is that they face the problem of certainty; that is, there is no reliable attribution, *isnads*. For example, the dream of Hatib al-Baghdadi that was reported in opposition to Abu Hanifa is attributed to narrators who are liars or those who are false or weak.¹¹¹ In general, other dreams face the same problem. In fact, when one looks at the footnotes placed in Ibn Abu al-Dunya's *Kitab al-Manamat* by investigators it can be understood that the dreams under discussion are rather weak as far as attribution is concerned.

On the other hand, another important problem in the biographical sources is that it is very hard to identify the dreamer. In fact, the narrators use such descriptive phrases as "a reliable person", "a person fond of worship", "one is of the knowledgeable", "one of the most virtuous of people", thus trying to cover

¹⁰⁹ Abū Ya'lā al-Farrā, *Ṭabakāt al-Ḥanābila*, I, 41. Cf. Ibn al-Jawzī, *Manāqib*, p. 537.

¹¹⁰ See: Ibn Hibbān, *al-Thiqāt*, IX, 101; Khatīb al-Baghdādī, *Tārīkh*, V, 180; al-Mizzī, *İbid*, I, 513; XXVI, 469. Cf. Leah Kinberg, "Literal Dreams and Prophetic Ḥadīth", *Der Islam*, (70) 1993, p. 295.

¹¹¹ For an evaluation of their isnāds see: al-Kavtharī, *Ta'nīb al-Khatīb*, p. 237, 287, 330.

up this problem.¹¹² Moreover, these phrases are used to emphasize the fact that the dreams in question were seen by reliable people and that they should be taken into account.

Like the dreams related in the basic hadith sources, it is stated that the dreams recorded in the biographical books cannot be used as evidence, but rather only to confirm rulings that have already been made. Al-Dhahabî, who recorded dreams about Ahmad b. Hanbal in a section of his *Siyer*, made the following evaluation: "Ahmad b. Hanbal has no need of dreams to prove that he was a leader in the discipline of hadiths. But the dreams are a support granted by God. In particular, there is the well-known report that he will give happiness to the believers."¹¹³

Along with this, it can be seen that there is a psychological importance that is placed on the dreams in the biographical sources although they are not used as evidence. In other words the dreams, in particular dreams concerning the Prophet, are used to try to insinuate that the person with whom the dream is concerned is either a good or bad person. There are even many truly ugly dreams from a religious or moral view reported about people whose ideas or beliefs were not accepted.

Dreams that concern leading scholars like Abu Hanîfa in the biographical sources are expounded in a way that reflects the psychological state of the dreamer.¹¹⁴ In actual fact, there are examples that show that the people were busy with the matter about which the dream was concerned before falling asleep.¹¹⁵ However, it is nearly impossible to explain these negative dreams totally in this way. In particular those who had negative dreams try to use the

¹¹² See: Ibn Abî al-Dunyâ, *İbid*, p. 65, 93, 134; Khatîb al-Baghdâdî, *Târîkh*, IV, 154; Ibn al-Jawzî, *al-Manaqib*, p. 540, 544, 568, al-Mizzî, *İbid*, I, 513, VI, 447.

¹¹³ al-Dhahabî, *Siyer*, XI, 353.

¹¹⁴ Ibn Abî Hâtim, *Adab al-Shâfi'i*, p. 174 (note of a critic al-Kavtharî); al-Mizzî, *İbid*, V, 577 (note of critic Bashshâr 'Avvâd).

¹¹⁵ See: al-Mizzî, *İbid*, I, 435.

fact that events came to occur exactly as happened in their dreams as a means of propaganda to show that their views were correct.

Even if it does not happen often, the dreams seem to be reported as evidence in some biographies. For example, Ibn Abi Hatim records two reports indicating that Malik b. Anas was on the right path under the heading of "Malik b. Anas' Rightness..." However, both of these narrations consist of dreams.¹¹⁶

¹¹⁶ Ibn Abi Hätim, *Taqdima*, p. 28.