

## THE WELFARE OF TURKISH MIGRANT WORKERS

Professor Dr. Nusret EKIN

Professor of Labor Economics and Industrial Relations,  
University of Istanbul, Faculty of Economics

### INTRODUCTION

Migration is not only an important phenomenon to Turkey but also to most Third World countries. Generally this trend has started since the end of the Second World War and since then the movement has been accelerated. In the initial period, migration was directed mainly to the industrialized countries of the Western World, but during the last decade the tide turned to oil-rich Arab countries as well (such as Saudi Arabia, and the United Arab Emirates of which half of the population are foreigners). It is estimated that about 15 to 20 million workers of the Third World countries earn their income in the industrialised or oil-rich countries and this figure increases year by year. Although the ratio of foreign workers widely change from country to country, generally 5 to 24 % of the labor force in these countries are migrant workers<sup>1</sup>.

However, following the beginning of the 1970s the host countries began to restrict the number of migrant workers after a careful study of the cost and benefits of guest wor-

---

1) In recent years migrants have comprised from 5 to 24 percent of the work force in Germany, France, Holland, Belgium, Sweden, Austria and Switzerland Population Crisis Committee; Labour Force Growth, Unemployment and Migration; Population; No. 7, Sept. 1977, p. 3.

kers. They claim that this action has been taken mainly because the cost of migrant workers to the host countries is increasing. They tend to be permanent employees rather than temporary. Therefore, the amount spent on social services show a tremendous increase. They also compete for the newly created jobs which are rather limited due to the world-wide recession. Therefore, this movement may be described as a "reaction to the increasing social cost and decreasing average income of the societies."

Needless to say, these conditions create high tensions among the members of host societies. The other aspect of the problem is that the receiving countries are trying not to be fully dependent on foreign labor and consequently are taking the necessary measures in order to get away from such undesired problems.

In this study our purpose is to evaluate this phenomenon from Turkey's viewpoint as a country intensively sending laborforce to the foreign labor markets. First, in order to display the importance and the dynamics of the migration phenomenon, we will try to point out the most outstanding problems our migrant workers face with in the receiving countries. Then, the historical development and regulations relating to the subject will be dealt with. In the last section, we will conclude our evaluation by giving a general outlook to the returning workers and their reintegration problems.

## I — THE MAIN PROBLEMS OF MIGRATION PHENOMENON

### A — Social Problems

#### Housing and Residence

1. The nature of problems have changed over time. The initial problems gradually found their own solutions or were resolved through the policies formulated by Turkey and the host countries, while new problems have emerged in the following years.

2. The most important problem of living abroad is the problem of housing. In addition to the unfavorable effect of worker dormitories, the difficulties that foreign workers confront in obtaining independent housing led to the development of slum areas.

3. According to some surveys made, 46% of the Turkish workers in West Germany had difficulties in finding housing. As 52 % of them have stated, the reason why their claims for hiring houses were refused was their being foreigners. As for the other 37%, they were refused because of the fact that they were Turkish workers.

4. Another survey which ranks the foreign workers having independent housing, indicates that the Turkish workers hold the last row in this ranking. It is also true that 52% of our workers in West Germany are living in the worker dormitories<sup>2</sup>.

5. The subject of providing the migrant workers with housing was included in the worker recruitment policies of West Germany which were designed by the bilateral agreements. However, as the years passed by, with the unification of the families and with the influences of illegal migrations, these responsibilities are no more being practiced<sup>3</sup>.

6. It is doubtless that the housing factor plays a very important role in the integration and adaptation of migrant workers and their families to the society they are living and working in. As we can see in the case of Berlin, when the foreign workers get crowded in certain areas, the rents begin

- 2) İş ve İşçi Bulma Kurumu Genel Müdürlüğü (General Directory of Employment Office), F. Almanya Çalışma Bakanlığı 72 Örnekleme Araştırması : Almanya'da Çalışan Yabancı İşçilerin İstihdamı, Aile ve İkamet Sorunları, (W. Germany Ministry of Labour, 72 Sampling Research : Foreign Workers' Employment, Family and Housing Problem in Germany), Ankara, 1974, p. 92).
- 3) Yüksel, A.G.; Ortak Pazarın Sosyal Düzeni ve Ortak Pazarla İlişkilerimizin Sanayimiz Açısından Sosyal Yapıya Muhtemel Etkileri (The Social Order of EEC and its Probable Impact on the Social Structure, vis-a-vis the Industry), Ankara, 1973, p. 72.

to go higher and then this becomes the cause of the ghetto phenomenon.

#### Health and Social Security Services

1. At present, some of the leading problems are associated with bilateral social security agreements which are based on the principle of equality and mutuality. Many disputes emerge from implementation of sickness, unemployment, retirement, on the job accidents, illness, maternity benefits and disability, death and family compensations. In combining social security coverages and in the transfer of benefit and fringe payments, problems related to the principle of mutuality emerge mainly due to the non-existence of unemployment insurance and family fringe benefits in Turkey.

2. In addition to the physical and psychological maladjustment of living abroad, the high propensity to save and the undernourishment aggravate health problems among foreign workers. Furthermore, language problems, insufficient knowledge about rules and regulations related to the work place increase accident rates.

3. The surveys indicate that the workers coming from the Mediterranean Region seemed to be less strong due to the psychological disturbances caused by the new working and living conditions, especially different climate and nourishment and being away from their families. In the meanwhile, because of the work load they have, they appeared to be less resistant to the sicknesses. However, as they have language problems and anxiety to be dismissed, they usually abstain from taking the benefit of sickness compensations.

4. In order to solve the nourishment problems, with the influence of religious traditions, especially the Turkish people living abroad establish butcher's shops, grocery stores, etc., to be able to get the food they were accustomed to eating in their home country. Thus, it can be said that gradually the health problems caused by the undernourishment would be losing its importance to an extent.

### Unification of Families and Children Compensation

1. Bringing the family together creates numerous and special problems. Almost half of the Turkish workers employed in the European labor market live away from their spouses and other family members. In fact, the isolation of worker from his family for a long period of time becomes a sort of unrest and tension both for the workers and the family and prevents the enjoyment of a normal life for the worker. Uniting the family members undoubtedly brings with itself such problems as housing, the education of children, decline in repatriation tendencies, decline in savings and others.

2. The most important requirement in many of the countries for the unification of the families is to prove that the worker can accommodate his family members in appropriate conditions and that the worker has been working in this country for a specific period of time. Any worker who can prove these, can take the spouse and the family members under the age of 18.

3. Although the process of unification of families is handled differently in national laws, bilateral and multilateral agreements, it has been accepted as one of the most natural rights of the migrant workers. In the modern world, we cannot think of any productive economic activity and a happy life based on families whose members are away from each other. When the worker is the head of the family, the country employing this worker should bear the social load which the family of the worker creates. In the European countries generally the family members of the foreign workers are given only residence permits but not the work permits. Sometimes the children of the migrant workers come to the receiving country to be students. Especially in West Germany the system of children compensation started in 1975, has accelerated this tendency. In this way, while the unification of the families are facilitating the adaptation and integration problems, the problems of the second generation have become more visible.

4. The Turkish workers have the highest rate among the married foreign workers in the western labor market but at the same time living away from their families. This fact creates very crucial family and health problems for both sides of the families.

5. The practical reasons which make the unification of the families harder can be mentioned as follows; the expenses incurring during the moving of the family especially for the ones coming from the distant countries, the other necessary costs for the care of the family, the difficulties in adapting to the new environment and finally the responsibility of the migrant worker to care for not only the spouse and the children but the whole family group including some of the close relatives.

6. When the unification of the families cannot be realized, it is certain that the family compensation gets more importance. We note that there are different implementations in the Western countries in this respect. In the group of countries including West Germany, Belgium, Holland, France, Austria and Switzerland, the migrant workers get payments according to the regulations being applied in their work places, for their children who are living in the home country. As for the second group of countries, England, Sweden, Norway and Denmark, they do not offer any compensation for the children of migrant workers whose residences are in their home country. The bilateral agreements determine the conditions covering the children compensation such as which children of the migrant worker will benefit from the compensation, the amount of the compensation to be paid, the age limit of the children in the payments. All these terms change from country to country.

7. As a matter of fact, although the children compensation is paid to the head of the family, if the worker does not take care of his children living in the home country, the amount in question can be deducted from his income and is sent to the spouse or to the real or the legal persons who are responsible for the cost of living of the children in Turkey. This practice is valid both in Holland and West Germany. In the example

of France and Belgium, the children compensation is paid directly to the person concerned.

It is certain that children's compensation and the related legislative regulations aim at the protection of the family members living away from the migrant worker.

## **B — Educational and Cultural Problems.**

### **Education of Migrant Workers' Children**

1. At present, one of the leading current problems is the education of worker's children abroad. As the West German example indicates, due to different implementations from state to state, no mutual educational policy exists between the respective governments. In 1975, close to 350.000 Turkish children under the age of 21 were living in West Germany<sup>4</sup> These children, approximately 400.000 with the addition of workers' children in other countries, have two important language problems, namely, learning their own language and the language of the host country. Some of these problems include such issues as teachers, books and periodicals, educational material, educational opportunities at different levels, the teaching of home culture, compatibility of the diplomas received in the host country with the educational system at home.

2. The concerned authorities in Germany, although in the beginning did not pay any attention to the great number of migrant workers' children, later started to be interested in the educational problems of this second generation. Because they have noticed that these children both due to the insufficiency of their German language and their integration problems, could not take the advantage of the general educational opportunities in the country and as a result of this, they would be inclined towards guiltiness. In 1976, "new measures to be taken for the social and vocational integration of foreign youth"

4) Südosteuropa - Gesellschaft; 350.000 Türkenkinder in Deutschland, München, 1977.

were proposed in this respect. Starting from 1980 these measures have been transformed into the vocational orientation and social integration measures. After these attempts, one can easily observe how hard the authorities are trying to integrate the foreign workers' children to the German society. These efforts include the increase in the number of nurseries, encouraging the acceptance of foreign children to the kindergartens which gives them pre-school education, providing better schooling and vocational training opportunities to the foreign children.

3. When we view the subject from the Turkish workers' aspect, despite all the increases in the educational opportunities, we note that the benefits to be received from these opportunities still remain limited. We must emphasize on two points here; a) The most important obstacle which must be removed by the Turkish migrant workers is the attitude of the parents towards the education needs of the children. This attitude is emerging from parents' lack of knowledge and economic problems. b) Secondly, the most important problem which effects the success of Turkish children in their school lives is their insufficiency in the native language of the country they are living in.

4. The educational problems of the second and third generation have never been approached in a serious manner and no efficient strategies and measures have been developed in this regard. Therefore, they still remain unsolved. Within the framework of bilateral and multilateral relations, the settlement of this matter holds a very crucial place, in the meantime, influencing the solution of adaptation and integration problems.

#### Vocational Training for Migrant Workers

1. The Turkish workers are confronted with innumerable problems in their training. Some of these problems are related to developing their skills, benefitting from opportunities of vocational and technical training.



2. Vocational and technical training is a very important factor as far as the national governments and the social politics of the EEC are concerned. As a result of this importance "European Vocational Training Center" has been established in 1977 in Berlin. The purpose of the center is to encourage and enlarge the scope of the vocational training on the community level. It is true that in West Germany 70% of the male and 80% of the female workers have not vocational knowledge<sup>5</sup>.

3. West Germany perceives the vocational training as a means of reintegration. According to the bilateral agreement which has been put into effect in 1973 vocational development courses on technical fields such as fitting, milling cutters, lathes and electro-techniques have been arranged free of charge for the Turkish workers who were working in the receiving country and wanted to return to their home land. These activities have been announced to the Turkish workers. The ones who have attended these courses got loans in Turkey to establish private businesses or work shops for themselves when they returned. However, it is hard to say that this project for the reintegration of the returnees based on vocational training was successful.

4. There are various associations in West Germany conducting vocational training activities for the foreign workers both in the work place and out the work place. Unfortunately, the Turkish workers, because of their limited knowledge of German cannot benefit from these opportunities. Moreover, a very large group of foreign workers are unaware of the uses of completing these courses.

#### **Cultural Measures for the Adaptation and Integration of the Migrant Workers**

The results of the surveys imply that the foreign workers by living in social isolation and feeling the physical

---

5) Yüksel, A.S.; op. cit. p. 59.

pressure of their daily work load are pushed into an environment of guiltiness. Actually the migrant worker's mind is most of the time busy with the idea of earning more money as soon as possible and the responsibility of his family members. This psychological state of the worker can be the beginning of some psychological and mental diseases. The working and living conditions of industrial societies are offering a great deal of insecurity to worker. The worker who has lost his social status in his close contacts with his friends and family members cannot find his place in his new way of living. In the meantime, the heavy working and living conditions increase the tendencies he is experiencing. The migrant worker, due to being away from his family, also have some sexual problems. Insufficiency of language, living in dormitories, poor housing conditions, these are all the factors which pile up and make the adaptation and integration matter of migrant workers more important.

1. In fact, such matters as recreation, adjustment and integration of workers with the traditions and culture of the host countries, their insufficient knowledge about their rights and responsibilities create many areas of conflict and controversy.

2. According to some surveys, 72% of the Turkish workers mentioned that they shouldn't get any assistance from German people when they first came to that country. While 18.5% of them stated that they have been refused by the people living in their environment, 53% said that they have been accepted by them unwillingly. As for the way the Turkish workers treated in their work places, 42% cited that they got different treatment than the Germans. On the other hand, 65% of the Turkish workers indicated that they could have good relations with their German friends in their work places<sup>6</sup>.

6) Türk - İş Dergisi (Türk - İş Confederation of Labour Review), Almanya'da Türk İşçileri : Alman İşçi Sendikaları Konfederasyonu Araştırması (Turkish Workers in West Germany : German Trade Union Confederation Research), No. 113, June, 1974, p. 21.

3. It is a very crucial factor for the migrant worker to know the language of the country where he is working as far as the adaptation matter is concerned. The factors such as sufficiency of the language, daily life, discipline at the work place, vocational advancement, safety in the work place, traffic rules influence the adaptation of the foreign worker to his environment to a considerable extent. For example, among the Turkish workers in West Germany, 7% stated their German knowledge as very good, 35% as average, 43% as bad, and 15% as none<sup>7</sup>. Excluding the migrant workers coming to West Germany from the neighbour countries, Yugoslavians are the ones who know best German as a foreign language. The Portuguese and the Turkish workers are the ones whose knowledge of German language is the poorest among the other foreign workers. It can be said that the facilities in this respect are not sufficient.

4. There are some activities regarding the Turkish folklore and drama organized by the Turkish workers themselves in the host countries. Although such activities can be considered as limited, still they contribute a lot to the social lives of our migrant workers. The expected results couldn't be attained from the attempts to establish cultural centres which were to offer the workers some recreational activities and to preserve their cultural ties with their country of origin as well.

5. The migrant workers who have strong national ties with their home country have established many associations to compensate the difficulties in integration and the other problems they experience. These associations have no definite legal identities and have not been registered in the home country either. Furthermore, the most of them don't have any head office and their addresses are constantly changed. Because of the fact that the associations' being highly politicized in the last years and the relations with the consulates

---

7) Ibid., s. 24.

getting weaker, the functions of the associations in integration and adaptation have been avoided.

6. There are radio and television programs appealing to the Turkish workers in the host countries<sup>8</sup>. a) The local German radios have Turkish programs prepared by the Turkish Radio and Television Association, everyday for 40 minutes. b) There is also a Turkish television program once a week in the third program of the German TV. Contacts are still going on in this respect between the Turkish and German television associations. The main subject they are discussing is the integration of the migrant workers' children without being assimilated and the protection of their national identities.

7. The German trade unions are publishing bulletins for their Turkish members. Besides, it is observed that the Turkish newspapers published in the home country do create pressure and public opinion in Europe.

8. In addition, some firms in the home country often organize concerts to be performed for our migrant workers in some of the big cities of Germany. There are also some movies where the Turkish workers can watch Turkish films. Also records and cassettes of Turkish music are available for the use of our workers in Germany.

9. There have been important attempts regarding the religious activities. In the regions where the Turkish workers are crowded, in order to meet their religious needs, small mosques are founded, and the efforts to have Turkish graveyard are still going on. Our workers trying to protect their religious traditions, support each other by collecting donations to send their funerals to the home country and celebrate together the religious holidays. They still keep the tradition of sacrificing sheep in the host country. In addition, we see that

8) Bonn Büyükelçiliği (Turkish Embassy in Bonn) Federal Almanya İşgücü Piyasası ve F. Almanya'daki Türk El Emeği (Labour Market and the Turkish Manual Labour in W. Germany), Ankara, 1976, p. 281.

the religious people who have been sent abroad by the Turkish government, besides their religious duties, also visit the Turkish people in the hospitals and prisons who have no relatives and need to be cared for. Furthermore, in order to teach religious beliefs to the younger generations, informal religious education programs take place. Our Ministry of Labor is trying to provide financial aids and to have relevant regulations to have these religious services practiced in an efficient manner.

### **C — Institutional, Administrative and Legislative Regulations**

1. In many cases, it is not possible for the migrant workers to participate in the organizations within or outside the work place and to benefit from the opportunities accorded by law or by contract. Many difficulties exist in their relationships and contacts with governmental organizations in following up the issues with the consulates and embassies abroad and lack of sufficient knowledge regarding the facilities and opportunities provided by the Turkish government for the migrant workers. Of course, there are problems related to free of charge imports of tools, equipment and household goods and productive employment at home upon return.

2. Especially when the local labor markets have favorable conditions and governments restrict the labor movements, an increase in the illegal migrations can be observed. The number of workers who might be called "tourist workers", from time to time reach 10% of the population of legal migrant workers. In such periods many Turkish workers with the help of some private offices, could enter the foreign worker employing countries with their touristic passports and had met no serious administrative obstacles. While the employers were trying to get the advantage of employing such workers, the administrative bodies remained indifferent towards this matter. In some cases, in the European countries, new legislative regulations were arranged to change the status of such workers to the status of legal migrant workers.

Thus, the conditions referring to these workers who have come to the foreign countries through illegal ways as groups or individually, have been legalized. These workers were in a situation to be persued by police, forced to leave the country and to accept to work in very unfavorable conditions.

3. In 1975, when the financial aids to the organization called "Arbeiterwohlfahrt", established by West Germany to find solutions to the problems of foreign workers, were ceased, many "Türk-Danış" organizations ended their activities. Türk-Danış is known as an organization which gives assistance to the migrant workers and their families who don't know the native language of the country.

In the recent years, we see that important decisions regarding the foreign workers and their families have been taken and relevant organizations were established. For instance, according to the decision of the Federal Government dated 19th March 1980, "the Council of Ministers have accepted the fundamental principles of developing a foreigners policy". Also the following points for the improvement of adaptation conditions have been emphasized; a) The Federal Ministry of Education and Science is trying to increase the opportunities for the pre-school and school education and vocational training for the foreign children. b) The Federal Ministry of Labor and Social Order, in order to attain the social integration and vocational orientation of the foreign youth, has planned to supply them with 15.000 training places during the period of 1980-1981 with the assistance of Federal Labor Institution. c) The Federal Ministry of Labor and Social Order also suggested to supply the young foreigners, who have already passed the age of formal education, with intensive language courses. d) It was required from the Federal Labor Institution to increase its services to provide the young foreigners with information on various professions. e) The Federal Ministry of Labor and Social Order gives the privilege of having work permits to the ones who have succeeded in these courses and completed the vocational training programs. f) The Federal Ministry of Education and Science will provide its

members who offer social consulting services to the foreign workers and their families, with the vocational training. g) The Federal Ministry of Youth, Family and Health is planning to have education programs for the social adaptation of youth, children and females. h) The Federal Ministry of Economic Cooperation will implement programs to support the development policy by trying to integrate the workers in their old professions and to vitalize their contributions to their own countries, upon their return.

4. Within the organizational structure, besides various official organizations of sending countries such as the Embassies, Consulates, Labor attaches, union representatives, social service assistants, the social, religious and some semi-official organizations of the receiving countries could also be interested in the problem of the migrant workers and their families. On the other hand, the migrant workers would also be in contact with police offices, financial and local organizations and similar official institutions. In other words, these migrant workers and their families are in touch with the official and non-official organizations in the sending and receiving country. As a result, the problems they face with during working and living, have a very complex structure which can be influenced by the laws of both countries and by the bilateral and multilateral agreements to a great extent.

## II — THE HISTORICAL DEVELOPMENT OF MIGRATION, PHENOMENON AND THE REGULATIONS REGARDING THE WELFARE OF MIGRANT WORKERS IN TURKEY

### A — The Development of Migration in Turkey

#### General Trends

1. Migration of the Turkish workers may be considered as the crucial part of the social, economic and political developments which have been taking place for over one and a half century.

2. There are two aspects of labor mobilization : First, the flow from rural areas to urban or into the towns. Second, the emigration to foreign countries which have been experiencing for the last twenty years.

3. The first example occurred mainly after 1950s because of the declining importance of the traditional agricultural sector, in contact with the progress of the industrial and service sector within the economy.

4. Turkey could not estimate the importance of the migrant workers when the international movement of workers started from Southern Europe to the more industrialized Northern European countries in the early 1960s. One may say that the country was unprepared for such a large scale of mobilization of the labor force.

5. It is also interesting to note that while Turkey has set up a State Planning Organization in order to realize its social and economic developments in a planned manner, it has failed to establish an efficient organization of whose purpose might have been solely to handle the migrant workers' policy at a national level.

6. While the number of migrant workers totalled only 2500 in 1960, it increased in the following years by nearly 100.000 every year. The total reached a peak of 800.000 in 1980 and West Germany with 540.471 Turkish workers is the country which has the most of our migrant workers. Although there are no official figures which show the total number of migrants, it has been estimated that the figure has reached more than 2 millions. This figure includes the workers' spouse and dependent children, their families and relatives. The figure also contains the number of students and professionals living in Germany.<sup>9</sup>

---

9) In 1980 the number of migrant Turkish workers is 882.290, total number of children of these workers is 744.766, and the number of the spouses of them who are not working is 390.046. This makes a total of 2.023.102 Turkish citizens who are living abroad. 1.765.788 of this number are in the EEC countries, 119.314 are



### The Nature of Early Practices

1. The policies and regulations concerning the migrant workers are finalized and applied by the Ministry of Labor and its official organization, The Employment Office. In 1972 an "Inter-ministrial Coordination Committee" was set up in order to create an efficient body in this field. While some of the receiving countries had established special recruitment offices, some have preferred to carry out this function through their Consulates in the home country.

2. In sending the migrant workers, another special way of implementation "called individually" or "anonymous worker groups" have also been put in to practice. During the last ten years, the ratio of workers demanded by name (called individually) has significantly increased and reached almost 36% of the total number of migrant workers.

3. Turkey has sent workers abroad according to the bilateral agreements signed on "Social Security and Labor Supply" with almost all Western European countries and with some exceptions, with most Arab countries.

4. While the demand was increasing, Turkey has developed a new type of migration policy which gave priority to anonymous worker groups. Allocated 15% to the "Village Development Cooperatives", 15% to areas which faced with natural disasters such as earthquakes, floods, Turkey has also restricted the number of skilled workers who are mainly employed in mining, ship-building and the military equipment industries<sup>10</sup>.

---

in the other West European countries and the remaining 138.000 are in the Middle East and North African countries.

Ege, Ünal; *Yurt Dışında Çalışanların Sorunları (Problems of Migrant Turkish Workers)*; Ankara, 1981 (mimeo), p. 5.

- 10) Devlet Planlama Teşkilâtı (State Planning Organization), with some priorities it has established on various dates determined, some criteria regarding the sending of the Turkish labour force to foreign countries. For further information please see: Abadan, Unat, N., Keleş, R., Penninx, R., Renselaas, H.V.; *Migration and Development*, Ankara, 1976, p. 10.

5. It is hard to say that a special policy has been applied according to the development of regions. Consequently the number of workers who came from the big cities such as İstanbul and Ankara has always been much higher than the rest. From time to time, interesting events may be noticed. For example, the translators may play important roles. Statistics indicate that a fairly large number of workers come from the translators' villages or towns, find job opportunities abroad.

#### The General Appraisal of the Turkish Policy

1. In spite of the experience of nearly twenty years, Turkey has not been able to establish an efficient organization whose function might have been to deal with the economic, financial, cultural and structural aspects of the migration problem.

2. Right in the beginning it was thought that giving priority to the workers from rural areas would create some sort of social investment and the country would benefit from the higher saving tendencies, and the desire to return to their homeland within a reasonable short period. But actual practices did not prove the correctness of this policy. Therefore, the officials tried to apply compulsory remittances and rotation schemes which were not successful either. I think it might have been better if they could have emphasized on the positive horizontal effects of migration rather than working solely on the vertical aspects.

3. One of the weaknesses of the Turkish system is related with the education and training and the waiting period in the pre-migration phase. A long waiting list usually meant wasting of time and money for already distressed workers. The scheme of "demand by name" created an unjustified situation and increased the unrest among the candidates. Also recruitment centers became places of wasting financial and other resources rather than an organization aiming to solve the problems of the migrant workers.

4. Consequently, individuals were left alone and they attempted to migrate or to re-unite the family members through illegal ways. This may be attributed to the inefficiency and the lack of coordination among these responsible organizations.

**New Opportunities in Migration from Turkey : The Middle East Countries as a Labor Market :**

In the 1970's, the phenomenon of worker migration acquired a new dimension in Turkey in the form of the oil-exporting Arab countries. Still, the number of workers we send to the big labor markets of the West in one year is as high as the total number we sent to the Arab countries in over ten years. The proportions of worker migration to Arab countries are thus extremely small. On the other hand, these workers work in a model in which the foreman is a Turk and their fellow-workers Ahmets and Hasans rather than Europeans. This phenomenon, which arises out of the fact that the contractor takes his own workers along, must be assessed in terms of Turkish economic and social structure.

Another special characteristic of the problems in these countries is that they must be considered within the framework of bilateral agreements rather than multi-lateral international relations as in the EEC. In some of these countries, Libya, for instance, the currency is not convertible. Savings in all the European countries, in contrast, are convertible. Family and child problems are largely non-existent in the Middle Eastern countries because the workers usually go as bachelors on short-term contracts. In Europe, on the other hand, we have a widespread family problem with close to 600,000 children and forty percent women.

Migration to the Mideast Muslim countries emerged in 1973 and was oriented primarily towards the OPEC countries. A total of seven countries, six in Asia and one in Africa, are involved here. The one in Africa is Libya, while the other six include Saudi Arabia, Oman, Kuwait, Qatar, Bahrain the United Arab Emirates and Iraq.

According to statistics compiled in the last few years, the proportion of foreigners in the total labor force is 43 percent in Saudi Arabia, 42 percent in Libya, 69 percent in Kuwait, 84 percent in the United Arab Emirates, 34 percent in Oman, 40 percent in Bahrain and 81 percent in Qatar. In other words, 51 percent of the total labor force in these countries is composed of native and 49 percent foreign workers. In some Arab countries the percentage is much higher. In fact, in the United Arab Emirates the foreign workers outnumber the native ones.

There are a few interesting reasons for the high level of employment of foreign manpower in these countries. First of all, one characteristic of most of these countries' demographic structures is under-population. No matter how high their rates of population growth may be, since they started with small populations and since any increase will only make itself felt in the work force twenty years from now, there is no question of a imminent increase in the youth or teenage population. Since these countries have such small populations in general, the proportion of foreign workers may appear deceptively large. Furthermore, the young structure of the population is largely responsible for the diminutive labor supply.

A second important factor in these countries is that they have been unable to develop sufficient numbers of technicians and skilled manpower for the large-scale development efforts they have undertaken, because they have a number of gaps in professional education and technical training and their existing resources are limited. These gaps, of course, bring up the question of skilled manpower as a stimulating force in economic development, the fact that these countries have opted for a "leap" into development beyond what their own economic conditions require may be regarded as a third factor. The reason for this is the sharp increase especially in oil revenues in fact, in per capita national growth surpassing even world standards. Kuwait, for example, leads the world

with a per capita national income of close to 16,000 dollars. The same may be said of the United Arab Emirates, Qatar, Saudi Arabia and Libya. The three fundamental long-term factors requiring the Middle Eastern Islamic countries to import manpower from abroad are thus 1) their small populations and high proportion of people too young to work, 2) their low proportions of technical and skilled manpower, and 3) their contrastingly high levels of production and management activity.

When we look at Turkey's place in this pattern, we see that the two main countries from the standpoint of manpower demand are Libya and Saudi Arabia. Up to the 1980's about fifty to sixty thousand Turkish workers had gone to Libya. More recent figures indicate seventy to eighty thousand. The issue of illegal workers is not so noticeable here as in the case of the European labor market. Saudi Arabia has about thirty or forty thousand, perhaps, according to some estimates, as many as fifty thousand Turkish workers.

The success of Turkish contractors in the Mideast countries has been striking, often downright astounding. The role of a common religion and historically rooted similarities together with the Turks' traditional love of and respect for Arabs have certainly played a vital role in this success. An important issue here is the fact that some traditional Asian countries have also joined these labor markets with extremely low wages and special programs. Turkey must develop appropriate policies to counter these new developments. Turkey's basic problem in this connection is to prevent the replacement of Turkish manpower by Asian workers, who work for extremely low wages and in a tightly organized and disciplined fashion. Even though the Asian workers work for low wages, however, the efficiency of Turkish power and its harmony with the Arab environment and social structure are factors that may outweigh the wage differential. In the final analysis, the common religion and the Turkish workers' superior skills and know-how constitute a potential sufficiency to compensate for the apparent advantage of cheap Asian labor.

In order to protect and develop our share of the manpower market in the Arab countries, we must, first try to protect the jobs of our workers there, second to find ways of replacing returning workers with new ones so as not to lose these jobs, and third to secure in this way the continuation of the present situation.

Some other things are also necessary: Measures to maintain the flow of Turkish manpower into new employment areas that will ensure economic development in the countries in question; studies of long-range development targets and development plans of the countries with labor demands; development of appropriate measures and policies; and long-range projections of the industry-related labor demand. Since eighty percent of our workers in these countries work for Turkish firms, the spread and growth of Turkish firms in these markets is an important factor influencing employment opportunities for Turkish workers. Studies we have done show that a contractor has to win a contract worth, 100,000 dollars in order to create a job for one Turkish worker. Thus, employment abroad and its support by contracting projects overlap to form a single phenomenon, making it imperative that Turkey discover more opportunities for Turkish companies in the Mideast countries.

A number of things therefore become necessary: For example we must keep close track of newly opened contracts for Turkish contractors; we must participate as a consortium in bidding on contracts; we must solve the problem of letter of guarantee; we must support projects and consulting firms; we must take it easier for firms to set up companies and function abroad; we must establish close relations with high-level administrators in these countries; and we must give priority to turnkey projects.

Another important consideration is giving preference to using Turkish building materials in order to stimulate domestic employment. At the same, in addition to the traditional oil-exporting countries, a number of new countries with invest-

ment potential could also be sought - the African nations, for example. If the firms both take along their own workers and also send additional workers to fill the manpower needs of foreign firms (German, Polish and Czech, for example), then many problems can be solved.

The developments that we can expect in these labor markets in the medium-term future can be summarized as follows: First, high levels of annual population growth around forty percent will eliminate the population shortage in most of these countries within fifteen to twenty years since the new-born babies of today will become old enough to join the labor force. It can be assumed that the natural growth in population will increase the amount of manpower by the year 2000, thus expanding the labor supply.

Second, in the next ten years these countries can be expected to complete their infrastructures and switch their attention from labor-intensive to other sectors. In other words, infrastructure investments in housing, roads, dams, irrigation and reforestation will give way to investment in the other industrial sectors, and these countries' labor demands will consequently begin to shrink. Since the construction sector is currently our biggest customer in contractor services, there is only limited room for optimism. In fact, the construction sector is already occupying a smaller and smaller part in Saudi Arabia's development plans, indicating that the need for foreign manpower is going to decline correspondingly.

Third, continual pumping of funds into infrastructure investment is sparking inflation in these countries and may pave the way to a relative stagnation in their economies. In particular, reducing oil exports or relinquishing control over oil prices in favor of more limited oil exports or lower priced oil may lead to a relative decline in these countries' foreign economic relations. Since this development will have its greatest impact on contracting and infrastructure investment, there will inevitably be indirect effects on foreign and Turkish workers.

Another relevant factor is the question of whether or not these countries will prefer employment policies oriented towards the Arab world. Especially if they decide to import workers from the less developed Arab countries that are not oil producers, the Asian workers and, to a lesser extent, the Turkish workers will naturally be affected.

In conclusion, it must be pointed out that the manpower needs of the Middle Eastern Islamic countries are not so very large on a relative scale. According to medium and long-range projections, these needs will at least remain unchanged in size. At the same time, one factor that may counteract the negative ones is that Turkish contracting companies are tending to play an ever bigger and more effective role in the Mideast countries and that there is a perceptible if limited increase in employment opportunities. When we look at the problem from the standpoint of all our foreign economic relations, we see that, although the labor demand of the European markets is static, the situation there is selfperpetuating in that the workers stay for longer periods and live as complete family units including wives and children. Even if Turkey sends no more workers abroad, close to thirty or forty thousand second-third-generation Turkish workers still join the European labor market every year. This is known as "hidden migration". This model however does not apply in the Arab countries because the workers there are on their own. Their tendency to stay permanently is relatively weak. For this reason, a rotation system is a more appropriate model. In the final evaluation, however, when the European and Arab labor markets are compared in terms of Turkey's migration phenomenon, it becomes clear that more profit will accrue from the Arab market if a model that includes contracting services is applied. When a worker goes on his own, his inclination to save is much stronger. Since he plans to stay only for a limited period, he transfers more of his earnings back to his country. Of course, the expectation of a secure and uncomplicated life in another Islamic country, in contrast with the usual adjustment problems encountered in Europe, also influences these workers' choices. But we are not thinking he-



re of the migration phenomenon merely as a movement of workers, but rather as the new shape, related to this movement, taken by our foreign economic relations.

The phenomenon of migration is more than a mere coming and going of people on account of the sale of commodities and products and the possibilities of introducing Turkish products that the workers take along or foreign products they bring back. Within this larger dimension, new models of steadily expanding foreign economic relations come to mind.

Now can conclude this new dimension of migration movement by giving its main characteristics as follows :

1. While the recession was going on in the Western economies, Turkey found a new opportunity to send workers abroad to meet the demand of some of the Arabic countries in the last few years. In 1980 the number of migrant workers in OPEC countries was nearly 100.000, the half of which constituted the ones working in Saudi Arabia. Besides Saudi Arabia, we can also mention Libya as another receiving country among the Arabic countries<sup>11</sup>.

2. These new developments manifest some interesting figures: a) First of all, the demand is mainly channeled to male workers, unlike the European countries which demanded the both sexes. b) The migrant workers in the Arabic countries are employed by the Turkish employers who are usually engaged in contractor businesses.

c) The Turkish employers in the Arabic Countries are applying new recruitment methods which are different from the ones used for many years in the Western labor market. In other words, these companies which win the bids in the Arabic countries recruit the labor force with their own resources and in their home country. After preparing the relevant

---

11) Çalışma Bakanlığı (Ministry of Labour) Yurt Dışı İşçi Sorunları Genel Müdürlüğü 1980 Yılı Çalışma Raporu (General Directory of the Foreign Labour Problems : Annual Action Report : 1980); Ankara, 1980, p. 1.

list of workers, they submit them to the Employment Office to be registered. Some of the Arabic Countries also using this method come to Turkey and recruit labor force in the similar manner. d) We notice that the problem of uniting the migrant workers with their families have not been solved in the Arabic Countries yet. These countries demand only male workers and still have many problems such as housing and etc. Therefore, they are against the unification of the families and as a result of this, the migrant workers have to go on living without their families. e) Although the employment of the Turkish workers abroad depends on the bilateral agreements and the individual contracts, the migrant workers in the Western labor market also benefit from the opportunities of the trade unions and collective bargaining. As for the migrant workers in the Arabic Countries, they definitely cannot take the advantages of these opportunities.

### **B — National Legislative and Administrative Regulations**

1. Legislative and administrative regulations regarding the migrant workers and their families might emerge from the national legislative and administrative regulations as well as from the needs of that country.

2. On the other hand, these regulations might also be originated from the bilateral and multilateral agreements. This fact can be true as far as the receiving and the sending countries are concerned. As a result, a group of legislative and administrative regulations concerning the migrant workers and their families arising from various sources comes out. It is certain that these regulations include many different subjects and fields, such as health, education, housing, social security, social welfare and some other facilities provided to the migrant families.

3. These regulations can be executed by official, semi-official or private organizations.

4. The migrant workers can be provided with the services covered in these regulations, before the migration, during

the pre-migration period or when they start to live and work in the receiving country. These can be as well provided when the migrant worker returns to his home country and needs to be readjusted to his environment with some specific strategies and policies.

5. Consequently, it can be said that with the services mentioned above, the necessary contacts with the official and non-official organizations can be attained both in home country and in the receiving country.

Therefore, we can talk about a network of complex factors, formed by various factors in this respect. Another interesting point in the matter is that these legislative and administrative regulations show a dynamic nature where the old problems and discussions are rapidly being replaced by the new ones.

#### **Institutions and Regulations**

1. In the development plans which have been made since 1963, each covering a period of five years, the problems of migrant workers were carefully dealt with and as an important element of development strategies, the employment in Turkey and the importance of foreign currency that the workers own, are being emphasized from the perspective of foreign economic relations. The necessary importance is given to the legislative and administrative regulations in the annual programs as well. a) For example, the Fourth Development Plan covering the period between 1978-1983 states that the problems of migrant workers are getting new dimensions. However, in the related plan period, the necessary measures for the solution of the migration problems couldn't be taken efficiently. The plan also states that the countries employing migrant workers, after the oil-crisis, instead of having new migrant workers, decided to integrate the old workers with the members of their own society and thus, gave more importance to the policies of that sort. Under these developments, it is expected that these countries, instead of demanding new labor force, will meet their labor needs with the labor force

they are using for the moment and with the children born or will be born of these migrant workers. b) On the other hand, according to the last plan, the education problems of the migrant workers' children are still going on. Because of the language problems, the children are unable to follow the normal education programs of the country. The necessary measures haven't been taken for the children under the age group of 0-6 to learn the native language of the host country. The rate of the migrant workers benefiting from the nurseries is very low. Due to the insufficiency of organizations in distributing books and the periodicals, the children of the migrant workers cannot take the advantage of this either. In West Germany especially the children who passed the age of compulsory education (6 - 15 yrs.) and haven't received any formal education there, have no chance of finding jobs. The matter of providing special vocational training to these young people whose number is aprx. 45.000 is being considered<sup>12</sup>. c) A law was put into effect in order to encourage the migrant workers to aid their relatives in their home country financially from their savings and to own property and small sized business or workshop by getting loans. However the expected results couldn't be reached. d) The Fourth Development Plan, in order to find efficient solutions for the problems of the migrant workers, aims at having these problems solved by providing the necessary assistance and participation of the government and municipalities of the host country. It also tries to take the necessary measures in solving their problems in their relations with Turkey, such as the problems they have with the Turkish Postal Services and Customs. e) In addition to the points mentioned above, the same plan will arrange

---

12) In the 4th Five Year Plan covering the period 1979 - 1983, the Turkish official authorities emphasized that about 45.000 children living in F. Germany who have already passed the age of compulsory education without having any formal education and have no chance of getting jobs, should be provided with special vocational training by Federal Germany. D.P.T. (State Planning Organization) 4. Beş Yıllık Kalkınma Planı : 1979 - 1983 (IV. Five Years Development Plan : 1979 - 1983), Ankara, 1979, p. 137.

programs both in Turkey and host countries for the migrant workers' children to get the Turkish culture in the best way, and will also try to provide them with the housing loans, let them have share with their savings in the companies under the government guarantee. Besides all these, the plan also proposes a set of organizational and legislative regulations. f) As far as the planned development practices are concerned, the basic problems lie in the matter of employment. In fact, contrary to conditions in the past, Turkish migration cannot be considered as a basic and sound employment policy. In this respect, it should be remembered that the first three development plans have defined migration as a part of the country's employment policy. Perhaps it is hard to say that the migrant workers are totally unemployed. The large part of these people come from either full or marginal employment sectors. In reality, despite the exportation of over three quarters of a million workers, there is no decrease in the amount of internal production. Therefore, quite rightly the fourth development plan has given up the old description and taken the matters as "excessive or surplus internal labor force".

2. When the labor flow to the foreign countries first began in 1960, we saw that some private firms were sending workers abroad. But these were the exceptional cases. Because the government tried to realize this migration movement by an official organization and by reorganizing the Employment Office, functioning as a related body to the Ministry of Labor, handled the employment activities and the process of sending the workers abroad through a special organization. In this manner, the Employment Office took all the responsibilities of the legal migration movement to the foreign countries.

3. The Employment Office, having its central organization in Ankara and at least one branch department in each city, has been spread all over Turkey. Anyone who wishes to work abroad has to apply to the Employment Office nearest to his residence or to his work place. The demands of the foreign countries which want to employ Turkish workers are

also being gathered in the similar manner. The distribution of the employment opportunities, the procedures concerning the passports of the workers and the way they receive every kind of information about their migration are under the responsibility of the Employment Office. However, when the worker leaves his home country to work abroad, all his contacts with the Office are ended.

4. As a related body to the Ministry of Labor, "The Department of Foreign Labor Relations and Migrant Workers" has been established and it was given the responsibility of dealing only with the problems of the migrant workers. This office, at the same time, attains the coordination among the labor attaches of the countries who are sending workers abroad. In addition, it can act as a party in the preparation of the regulations and agreements and the measures which indirectly concern the migrant workers and which are to be established by the receiving countries.

5. Besides the dynamic nature of the migration movement, the matter has many problems originating both from working and living abroad. Thus, a committee called "Inter-Ministrial Coordination Committee" has been established in 1972 to solve the problems of migrant workers in a coordinated manner. The ministries which are the members of this committee are as follows: The Ministry of Labor, Foreign Affairs, Financial Affairs, Village Affairs, Construction and Improvement, Education, Home Affairs, Customs and Monopoly and Transportation. The representative of the Ministry of Labor also acts as the secretary of the committee.

#### **Processes and Policies**

1. When we look at the process of recruitment of workers from Turkey, we notice that, besides the Employment Office, in the previous years, France, Hollanda and W. Germany tried to have permanent recruitment centers in Turkey. Sometimes the Consulates of the European countries applied to the Employment Office to inform the authorities that there were employment opportunities in their countries. We have met such

practices in the cases of "Called individually-demanded by name". Belgium Mining Federation has also established its own recruitment office in order to meet the employment demand of their country. Today we see the Arabic Countries using the same method.

2. The workers who will go abroad are required to have some qualifications such as to be in a certain age group, to be literate, to complete the military service, to have good records with police. The candidates fulfilling these conditions can take the vocational skill examination and have health control. All this information after being evaluated in the central organization, is sent to the related branch offices and the final result are announced to the candidates. Then the Employment Office helps the candidates who are entitled to go abroad in their passport and other formalities. No taxes and duties are required from the workers for their passports.

Certain policies have been applied to the matter of distribution and allocation of the employment demands of the foreign countries, such as a priority of 2 years for the less developed and of 1 year for the developing areas have been given.

4. The workers who are coming from the areas which had natural disasters are also given priority in going abroad. But this kind of priority is applied to the anonymous workers' groups. To avoid the negative effects of migration on Turkey's industrialization, some restrictions were put as far as some professions and qualities of workers were concerned. But unfortunately it is indeed difficult to say that all these strategies and policies applied had been successful.

## C — Bilateral Agreements

### Development of Bilateral Agreements

1. Although the scope of the migration movement enlarged very rapidly, its start in 1960 was somehow coincidental. In West Germany the greatest emphasis in this regard is given to the vocational training programs. Even in 1956, the

members of the University of Kiel suggested a training program for the Turkish people who were lycee graduates, in order to employ these people as supervisors in the industrial firms to facilitate the activities of the German investments in Turkey. Then, in 1957 small worker groups started to go to Germany through some private firms in an illegal manner.

2. After 1960, when Turkey has entered the planned development period, in the first development plan it was stated that as a measure to develop more rapidly, excessive labor force could be sent abroad. Under these development tendencies, a labor force agreement with West Germany has been signed in 1961. Following this agreement, similar agreements with Austria, Holland, Belgium in 1964, with France in 1965, with Sweden and Australia in 1967 have been signed.

In the later years, such agreements were signed with Arabic Countries, each having general principles regarding worker recruitment, employment, wages and other working conditions.

3. The social security rights of the migrant workers and their families were also arranged in the bilateral social security agreements. We note that these rights were formulated differently in each agreement. The first social security agreement has been signed with England in 1961. The similar agreements signed with the other countries are as follows; in 1964 with Germany, in 1966 with Holland, Austria and Belgium, in 1969 with Switzerland, in 1970 with Denmark, in 1972 with France.

4. One of the basic objectives of the bilateral agreements is to show that the formalities regarding the recruitment of the workers from Turkey are under the authority of the Turkish Employment Office and of the employers abroad or of the organizations acting as the representatives of these employers to have these points and concepts accepted. The purpose of having formalities relating to the conditions under which the workers are allowed to migrate is to protect the Turkish workers and the foreign employers from the evil intentions of some people and organizations.



### Recruitment Processes

1. The selection process of the migrant workers within the framework of the related agreements are executed in two phases; the first selection is made in Turkey by the Employment Office. The first phase of the selection process which is in compliance with the bilateral agreements, must be followed by another final selection phase in which the applicants' feasibility to work and health are reexamined. During these examinations the representatives or the employers of the receiving countries can be present. In the bilateral agreements the travel expenses and the way the selected workers go abroad are also mentioned.

2. The point of migrant workers' reaching the receiving country safely and without spending too much time has also been included in the bilateral agreements. As a rule, the travel expenses of the migrant workers belong to the employers.

### Inquiries of Agreements

1. In the bilateral agreements, the terms relating to the migrant workers returning to their home country are also mentioned. If a worker is forced to leave his job because of his own fault, he has to pay his returning expenses himself. In some of the agreements (as in the one between Turkey and Belgium) there is such a term; if it is proved that the worker does not have any money, his returning expenses then can be paid by his employers. In some of the other agreements the returning expenses of the worker are afforded by the governments of both sending and receiving countries (as in the agreement between Turkey and France).

2. The travel expenses of the migrant workers incurred during their visit to their home country in their annual holidays, as a rule belong to the workers themselves. There is an exception to this rule in the agreement signed with Holland. That is, the workers who have completed the period of the first contract successfully and got the right of signing the

the second contract are paid the one way expenses of the trip by the employers.

3. The most important and the marked aspect in the bilateral agreements is the free transfer of the remittances of the migrant workers to Turkey. Only Libya by putting a limit, allows 80% of the remittances to be transferred. The free transfer of the workers' remittances is one of the most important factors which increases the labor flow.

4. In the bilateral social security agreements both countries conform to the principle of mutuality. We can mention the following points pertaining to the social security rights of the workers which are included in the social security agreements; health measures, sickness insurance, accidents at work place, occupational diseases, unemployment, retirement, maternity, children's compensation, death, permanent disability and helping the family members. Actually the migrant workers can take their families to the receiving country and live there together with the permission of that country. In order to get this permission the worker should prove (as in West Germany) that he has been working in this country for one or two years, has got the permanent work permit and can accommodate the family members under suitable conditions with his income.

5. For a worker to benefit from the unemployment compensation in West Germany, he has to have a permanent work permit. In addition, in the agreements signed with Belgium and West Germany, it is stated that the workers who have children at home country could also get partial children's compensation. The most important problem Turkey has faced with in its relations with West Germany where the most of our migrant workers live and work, is the determination of retirement pay. Legal attempts have been made in this respect to combine the durations worked both in home country and in Germany.

6. When we take a look at the social security rights in the framework of bilateral agreements, we would note that

these rights are given to the workers by the governments of the receiving countries according to the legal status attributed to them. Although it differs from country to country, it is very easy to point out that the Turkish workers never have the same rights and the status as the native workers of the country have. In general, we cannot say that Turkey has got successful results from the bilateral agreements because, instead of gaining bargaining power, Turkey has been always forced to accept the terms and conditions suggested by the other party in such cases.

#### **The Analysis of Bilateral Agreements From Turkey's Viewpoint**

1. In fact the labour agreements are documents which fundamentally specify the rules and the methods of the cooperation between the official authorities concerned in the sending and receiving countries. Within this framework important subjects such as simplification and acceleration of worker sending formalities, signing of the job contracts, equal treatment to the foreign workers are carried out.

2. Although bilateral agreements show differences from country to country, they have some standard provisions which are valid in almost all countries. One of the important characteristics of bilateral agreements is that supply and demand of labour force are arranged through the official authorities. In other words, the institutions which are given authority by Turkey and the receiving countries in this respect collect workers, send them abroad and find jobs for them. This authorized institution in Turkey is the Turkish Employment Office.

3. In the practices of last 20 years, the migration process has been realized by the Turkish Employment Office. However, the "tourist workers" and the illegal migrations (will be emphasized later) which have become the problems of the receiving countries more than Turkey, can be stated as exceptions to the above practices. The workers going

abroad in such ways abolish the rights of the workers waiting their turns to go abroad and at the same time they cannot take the advantage of the social services and legal security provisions offered to the migrant workers.

4. One of the standard provisions of the bilateral agreements is the preliminary selection of the candidates. Although age limit varies from country to country, health conditions, vocational ability, not having committed an offense or crime are required for the pre-selection. As for the final selection of the candidates, this is being done by the liaison office or the representatives of the receiving country. Health examinations and vocational ability controls of the candidates are repeated in this stage too. If the candidate passes this stage successfully, his contract then can be signed.

5. The next stage in the bilateral agreements is the arrangement of the formalities regarding the worker's going to the receiving country. The workers who have already signed their contracts are being transferred in groups and according to specific schedules to the receiving countries by the Turkish Employment Office. The accommodation and transportation expenses of the workers during their voyages are paid by the liaison office or the representative acting on behalf of the employer. To place the workers in their jobs is the responsibility of the concerned institution in the receiving country.

6. All of the bilateral agreements include the principle of equal treatment to the Turkish migrant workers with the native workers as far as the job safety and health, working conditions, vocational training, social security and union rights are concerned. However, in practice it has been observed that this part of the bilateral agreements most commonly are not followed. In administrative and legislative regulations we very often meet priorities given according to nationalities.

7. Another common provision included in all bilateral agreements is the worker's transfer of his savings to Turkey without any problems.

8. In order to provide the better orientation of the Turkish workers to their working environments, terms are included in some of the agreements. For example, in the agreement between Belgium and Turkey the arrangement of language courses for our workers are stated. In addition to that, the employers have to provide housing for the single workers.

As for the bilateral agreement between Holland and Turkey, it also requires the necessary assistance of the Holland official institutions and employers to the Turkish workers especially when they first come to that country in order to facilitate their orientation. In some of the bilateral agreements more concrete measures are included. Namely, the official institutions would help the Turkish workers and their families to find appropriate housing and in case of any difficulty they would temporarily provide them accommodation and if the worker does not start to work in the first week, he is provided food and accomodation free of charge during this period and furthermore, on the basis of equal treatment he and his family would benefit from the social services.

9. Another important provision in this regard is the formation of the "joint committees" which would find solutions to the problems met during the implementation of the agreements and deal with the necessary modifications. In almost all of the bilateral agreements that Turkey has signed there are such terms.

10. If we want to evaluate the matter in general, we can say that especially in the years when the labour movement first started, the bilateral agreements have important functions as regulating the labour movement from Turkey to Western Europe, establishing specific rules in this respect and protecting the rights and the interests of the migrant workers, their employers, sending and the receiving countries.

11. In the bilateral agreements, the mechanisms relating to the worker recruitment process carried out in the sending

country and his being sent to the country where he will work have lost its importance from Turkey's side.

Actually from the oil crisis in 1974 till now, Turkey's labour export to the European labour markets has been decreased rapidly and acutely. As a consequence of this, the Turkish Employment Office start to emphasize its internal functions or to send labour force to the oil producer Arab countries, instead of recruiting labour force to the West Europe. In parallel to this, the recruitment offices of the receiving countries also stopped functioning and are closed.

12. On the other hand, the problems relating to the integration of the workers in the receiving countries and their re-integration in their home country upon their return gained importance and has become a popular matter.

13. The reason why the bilateral agreements lose their functions in the course of time is that instead of trying to find solutions relating to the welfare of the migrant workers and their families in such agreements, Turkey is tending to solve these within the framework of EEC Social Policy. Therefore, the relevant demands and measures are tried to be based to a great extent, on the social polices of United Nations, ILO, OECD and especially EEC which all effect the social policies of the European world.

14. As far as the provisions of the bilateral agreements and their interpretation are concerned, Turkey could never have the sufficient initiative in this field. The quality and quantity of the labour force sent to the foreign countries were always based on the evaluations of the specialists in those countries and were determined by the movements prevailing in their economies.

#### **From Receiving Countries' Viewpoints**

1. In spite of the facts mentioned above, the orientation of the migrant workers to their environment is one of the most important matters handled in bilateral agreements. For

example, in the bilateral agreements Turkey has with Federal Germany and Belgium, the employers have the responsibility of finding housing at reasonable prices and opening language courses. In Federal Germany and Holland there are some religious and social assistance associations which can also help the migrant workers in such problems. Furthermore, in Federal Germany and Belgium there are some psychological orientation programs designed for the mining workers. These programs are being applied to the workers before they start to work under the ground, in the mines.

2. According to the valid bilateral agreements, for a Turkish worker to appear as working in one of the receiving countries, he has to have a work-permit. Work-permits, being arranged according to the national laws and in conformity to the national benefits, are determined by the provisions restricting the number of workers, their nationalities and the areas where they could work. When there are labour deficiencies, these restrictions of areas and vocations can be made more flexible. It is a fact that in such periods, many Turkish migrant workers, instead of waiting their turns, could go to the foreign countries as tourists, be welcomed by the employers and met no resistance of the official authorities there. Some of the receiving countries have legalized the entrance of "tourist-workers" to their countries (Belgium on 1st Feb. 1966 and 1st Aug. 1974, France on 1st June-1st Nov. 1973 and Holland on 1st March 1975). Trying to live and work in a foreign country under the status of a tourist is a unsecure and uneasy way of living where the person can always be faced with the danger of being punished because of of the illegal residence and being forced to leave that country. Under these circumstances, such Turkish workers accept very low wages and live in extremely bad houses. Therefore, among the migrant workers, they are the ones who live in the worst living and working conditions.

3. Despite the clearly stated provisions of the bilateral agreements, many Turkish migrant workers complain about the lack of vocational training and about the frustration ca-

used by the jobs they have. The most important reason for the workers not to advance in their working lives and not to get better jobs with higher wages is that they are not provided with the language courses neither in their home country before they leave nor in the receiving countries. This is also true for the vocational training programs.

4. In the years when the labour movement first began, it has been thought that the migrant workers, upon their return to their home country would be skilled and contribute to the industrialization of the country. But the fact is that a great number of Turkish migrant workers could not get the chance of being employed as skilled workers and they continued to have jobs which the native workers of the country refuse to have. Moreover, it is hard to say that the experience and the qualifications a Turkish worker might attain during his stay in that foreign country could answer the needs of our industry.

5. Federal Germany, the country in which more than 80% of the migrant Turkish workers are working in last 20 years, has a special importance as far as the provisions of bilateral agreements relating to the welfare of the Turkish workers and their families are concerned. In 1970 a committee established by the Ministry of Labour of this country, has published a document called 'the principles of unification of the foreign workers with their families'. These principles have been modified and accepted on 20th April 1972. In the same document, they have tried to estimate the need of German industry for the foreign workers in the coming years. The subjects such as unifications of the families, provision of language courses, vocational training, social consulting services, housing, educational facilities for the children of the workers were also being mentioned in this document.

6. In the root of these measures lies the development model of Germany which is based on foreign workers. Although such measures have given comfort and flexibility to the employers and economy in terms of labour supply, foreign labour's being more expensive in the course of the time and



causing the technological developments to slow down, have changed the viewpoints in the problem of foreign workers. In German economy the social infrastructure services needed by the Turkish workers caused great investments, the amount of which balanced the benefits that would be attained by employing foreign workers in the economy.

7. The question "who will afford the social costs of foreign workers, government or the employers?" also creates serious tensions. In 1973 Federal Government by establishing new regulations, held the employers responsible for the social costs of foreign workers and their housing problems. Furthermore, the administrative expenses which the employers importing foreign labour force have to pay, have been increased from 300 dm. to 1000 dm.

8. These measures taken by the Federal Government have removed the rotation system completely which had a purpose of keeping the foreign workers in Germany for a specific period of time and then providing them to return to their home country and have new ones for their places. Actually, the new program has measures for the better integration of foreign workers with the German Society.

9. In smaller dimensions the similar situation is valid for France too. France, while avoiding the coming of workers from non-EEC countries on 3rd July 1974, stated to take necessary measures on 21st May 1975 to settle down the matter of foreign workers who have previously come to France and found jobs there. On 1st July 1975 it has been decided that these workers could take their families to France. In addition to that vocational training and general education facilities for these workers have been prepared and new cultural institutions were established in order to provide the integration of the foreign workers with the French Society.

10. When we consider all the above developments, we can say that the provisions regarding the welfare of the migrant workers and their families are being effected by the current foreign labour policies of the countries rather than the bilate-

ral agreements between them. While such policies, starting from the middle of 1970, has been directed toward the labour movement within the EEC countries, the integration of foreign workers has started to effect the social welfare services more rapidly. The development that accelerates this tendency is the second and the third generations who were born in that foreign country and by itself create a very important problem.

11. After all these developments, new regulations regarding the welfare of Turkish migrant workers and their families can be observed in 1980' s. For example, on 19th March 1980 the council of Ministers in Federal Germany has accepted the basic principles to improve the foreign policy and thus, in order to provide better orientation conditions and to realize this purpose, including the states and municipalities, strong attempts were decided to be made.

12. On the other hand on 1.1.1980 the children's allocation law has been modified and the workers who have been working for 15 years in Federal Germany and received money for their children living in Turkey, were no more going to benefit from this allocation. Many Turkish workers have objected this new practice in legal ways and their objections were accepted.

13. In South Bavaria, the local labour office with a new criminal law which was put into effect on 1.1.1980, decided to offer vocational training to the prisoners including the Turkish ones.

14. In May 1980 German and Turkish Ministers of Labour have reached an agreement on the following points; to offer wider vocational training opportunities to the Turkish youth in Germany, in order to provide better orientation conditions to give them work-permits after a 1 year's training program without having to wait for 4 years, to enable the ones who have legally obtained the right, with permanent residence permits, to give special work-permits to the spouses of the workers who have been working in Germany for five years, to allow the workers not to work during their religious holidays,

to give them the right of voting in the local elections, to compensate the difference in the children's allowances paid in Turkey, to give the right of keeping their jobs during the short-term military services in Turkey, to provide translators free of charge to the workers for their transactions in courts in connection with the labour affairs, to solve the problems of the young people who are in reform schools.

15. As a conclusion, we can say that the bilateral agreements are getting insufficient in the solution of the problems regarding the welfare of migrant workers and their families. Moreover, even the social policies of EEC could not establish the necessary coordination and harmony in the administrative and legislative regulations regarding the welfare of the migrant workers and their families. While with this lack of coordination the conflicts among various countries remain unsolved, the same problem, at the same time, caused chaos and disagreements between the sending and receiving countries. Therefore, at least among the EEC countries a general strategy must be established regarding the subject.

16. It is very obvious that these practices which are far from being coordinated, stable and effective are more important for the people coming from the countries which are not the members of EEC. While the provisions in the bilateral agreements cannot contribute much to the welfare of the migrant workers and their families, the provisions from the national legislative and administrative regulations keep their characteristics of being more effective in this field. Therefore, the efforts of United Nations, ILO and EEC which will play more effective roles in our modern labour world are needed.

## **D — The Turkish-EEC Relations**

### **The Employment of Foreign Labor in the EEC**

1. During post-war era a very significant development in the European Community has been the growing problem of foreign workers in the European labor market. This develop-

ment has resulted in a population of migrant workers and their families reaching 13 million which corresponds to 6% of the total population of the EEC countries. Major changes have doubtless occurred in the composition of foreign workers in Europe in general and in the EEC countries in particular. Labor movements in the EEC countries can be classified under two groups, viz., labor movements within the EEC countries and labor movements outside the EEC countries.

2. As general tendencies, foreign labor from countries outside the member countries have gained significant importance in time.

The highest number of workers from member countries were from Italy followed by Ireland. The highest number of workers from non-member countries were from Turkey followed by Portugal, Yugoslavia, Spain and Algeria. The heading host country was West Germany with 1,9 million migrant workers in 1980. The second leading country in that context was France with 1.9 million migrant workers.

3. Following the period after the energy crisis, the EEC members have put up considerable obstacles to overcome worker migration from other countries. In fact, the number of foreign workers in the member countries has decreased considerably.

4. According to the recent facts and tendencies that even if West Germany totally bans labor migration into the country, the number of foreign workers in the country will increase at a rate about 50 thousand workers per year until the present generation of workers' children reach employable age. Of course, this is a kind of "Disguised migration". Consequently, significant discussions have emerged on the subject of integration, rotation, re-integration or assimilation of workers from non-member countries.

#### **Free Labor Movement Within the EEC**

1. The subject of worker migration within the member countries is a totally different matter. The Treaty of Rome

as will be remembered according to Paragraph (c) of Article 3 stipulated that obstacles to the free movement of not only goods but also of "People, Services and Capital" within the member countries should be removed. This treaty envisages the free movement of labour to be realized in two different areas namely, the free movement of workers (Articles 45-51) on the one hand, the right of residence (Article 52-58) on the other.

2. Basic principles on the free movement of foreign labor from and within member countries and the limitations thereto are important topics that need detailed emphasis on such matters as organisation of labor movement entrance and residence rights, employment mechanisms, employer-union relationships, residence, taxation, vocational training, work orientation and free movement of workers' family members<sup>13</sup>.

3. The EEC program on migrant workers and families was presented to the Council of Ministers on December 18, 1975. Following the views and approval of the Economic and Social Committee and the European Parliament, the Council included the program in its resolution dated February 9, 1976.

#### Migration to Europe or to the EEC : Which is the Case?

1. The Turkish-EEC relationship was, after long years of negotiation, finally sealed on the subject from a social political perspective. It is apparent that basically the agreement is geared towards economic relationships.

The Ankara Agreement does include a few articles related to social problems; Article 2 provides for "Improving the level or working conditions and the standard of living of Tur-

13) This subjects has been discussed various times by Turkish and German official organizations in different dimensions such as State Planning Organization, Turkish Ministry of Labour, F. German Employment Office and Ministry of Labour. Barrowcliff, G.; Puyvelde, E.V.; Göçmen İşçiler ve Avrupa Topluluğu (Migrant Workers and the EEC), Avrupa Topluluğu Dergisi; Sayı 14, p. 14.

kish people", while Article 4 refers to the "compatibility of Turkey's economic policies with those of the Community for better functioning of the Association", and finally, Article 12 stipulates that the signatories will benefit from Articles 48, 49 and 50 of the By-Laws to eventually reach free movement of workers between their respective countries.

2. While the Turkish-EEC relationship developed along these lines, demand for foreign labor from the European countries reached Turkey following the 1960's. Demand for labor came almost totally from the outstanding member, West Germany. This demand would doubtless have come in any case, if not at the same magnitude without the formal relationships that had just started with the community. During the past 20 years, the only opportunity Turkey acquired in exporting manpower to the member countries came through bilateral agreements, so that emerging problems had to be resolved within the framework of these bilateral agreements.

#### **The Additional Protocol and the Free Movement of Turkish Workers**

1. The supplementary protocol signed on November 23, 1970 and put into effect as of March 1, 1973 provided additional advantage and opportunities to the Turkish workers employed within the Community who had previously sought and obtained employment opportunities within the framework of the bilateral agreements.

Worker mobility between Turkey and the member countries will be accorded progressively between the twelfth and the twenty-second year following the application of the Agreement within the stipulations of Article 12 of the Association Agreement.

2. Under this provision, December 1976 was to be the beginning date for the free movement of the Turkish labor force within the Community. Thus, full freedom of movement was to be reached on a progressive basis within a period of 10 years. Article 6 of the Supplementary protocol refers to

Articles 48, 49 and 50 of the Treaty of Rome via Article 13 of the Ankara Agreement.

3. This new period initiated by the Supplementary Protocol marks the beginning of a new era which represents the abolition of worker migration under the mono-type bilateral agreements "Under the bilateral agreements, the demand for manpower was determined by the employers of the host country. Furthermore, these employers could also demand workers by name. This undoubtedly conflicts with the free movement of workers as stipulated by the Treaty of Rome".

4. In addition, migrant workers employed under bilateral agreements have lower working and living standards compared with the workers of any member country. Consequently, unfavorable changes in the labor market obviously are reflected on foreign workers covered by bilateral agreements. Therefore, the most obvious aim for the Turkish workers employed in the member countries should be to provide for them identical levels of social policies and security that are implemented in the member countries.

#### Resolutions of the Council of Association

The above developments under the Supplementary Protocol paved the way for the Association Council to determine the procedures in line with Article 36 of the Protocol during its December 20, 1976 meeting. Consequently, in addition to the provisions of the Ankara Agreement and the Protocol, more concrete measures had to be drawn up and implemented for the Turkish workers employed in these countries. The discussions at the Council meeting indicate the following:

1. The Association Council, because of extensive unemployment in addition to other factors, was not lenient to initiate the 10 year progressive free movement system, and, in fact, had envisaged to suffice with another declaration on the subject.

2. It is quite obvious that the report prepared by the Committee and submitted to the Council contained provisions

more advanced than the resolutions of the Association Council. The Council's Ministers had objected to the report prepared by the Committee at the July 20, 1976 meeting. Unfortunately, the Council's resolutions fell short of the principles.

3. The impact of Turkey's employment structure on relationships with the EEC should doubtless be studied in depth. Obviously the extensive "labour surplus" in Turkey, together with the deficiencies at higher levels, constitute major factors that hinder the initiative of progressive free movement for Turkish workers in the EEC as of 1976.

4. 1976, has therefore, been a critical period for Turkey's relationships with the EEC. While Turkey maintained its objectives, and while the free movement of Turkish workers have become a symbol of Turkey's relationships with the EEC; the Community had to make certain concessions no matter how limited they might be.

#### **The New Order Provided by the Association Council**

1. The new opportunities brought about by the Association Council for the period ending December 1, 1980, though important, is hardly sufficient. Most of Turkey's demands were obviously considered unacceptable. For example, in the unification of worker families, granting work permits to newly coming family members, as the worker is allowed to bring dependents, residence permit is accorded to these dependents, but no work permit is given. The definition of family obviously is limited to non-employable dependents. The same situation prevails with regard to work permits for the worker's children.

2. On the other hand, the Association Council has succeeded in preventing the deportation of Turkish workers in case of unemployment. Even if unemployment payments cease, the residence permits of the unemployed workers are valid, and new opportunities are given to workers who have been employed for a minimum of 3 or 5 years. A second preference right is granted to Turkish workers who are currently emplo-



yed in the Community. The majority of workers currently employed in the EEC countries have worked for over 3 years and in fact 70% have worked for over 5 years. Therefore this geographical mobility is available only to workers that are already employed in the member countries<sup>14</sup>.

3. Turkey was refused in her demand that second preference rights be accorded to Turkish workers, if and when the labor market tensions are eliminated and the flow of manpower from Turkey into the Community starts. Furthermore, the Council Resolutions contain no recommendations even in principle in the area of vocational training for Turkish workers.

#### General Tendencies and Recent Developments

1. Turkey is one of the countries that initiated relationships with the Community from more or less the beginning. Certain progress was made in matters of employment through the Ankara Agreement, the Supplementary Protocol and the 1976 Council Resolution; however, the outlook is not promising for the next 10 years. In fact, Turkey did not enter the first 4 year phase that terminates in 1986 with sufficient advantages from the standpoint of free movement of workers.

2. The Turkish-EEC relationship basically centers around economic problems. However, opportunities obtained by Turkey to send workers to European and especially to the EEC countries and the great importance assumed by workers employed within the Community have brought labour problems to the front line in the Turkish-EEC relationships. Despite the considerable lag in the flow of manpower to the community, the growing number of workers' children at a magnitude of 30-40.000 per year, entering employable age and seeking

---

14) Ekin, N.; Turkish Labour in the EEC; Die Türkei auf dem Weg in die EG, Möglichkeiten und Probleme einer Vollmitgliedschaft der Türkei in der Europäischen Gemeinschaft; R. Oldenbourg Verlag; München - Wien; 1979, p. 91.

employment at labor markets, have brought new dimensions and a new dynamism to the subject.

3. Advantages provided for Turkey under the pressures it has exerted on the Community were confined to a few and limited new opportunities to Turkish workers already employed within the EEC countries. Even in these, the Community is hesitant as indicated by the subject of residence permit which is so broadly handled as to obscure the work permit concessions. Similar tendencies can easily be observed in the case of Turkey's treatment as a second preferred country in case of labor demand from third countries.

4. As mentioned earlier, Turkey's manpower exports were conducted through bilateral agreements since 1960. Thus Turkey has had the opportunity to send workers to countries outside the EEC and especially to the member countries. Therefore, Turkey's manpower exports should not be considered as an outcome of Turkey's relations with the EEC. In fact, it can easily be said that Turkey has exported labour not to the EEC but to Europe.

5. The main problem here is to handle the various problems that confront the Turkish workers in their working and living conditions and in their environment within the framework of social standards developed for foreign workers from member countries. The Resolutions of the Association Council have provided some limited means whereby the problems of Turkish workers abroad are handled within the structure of the Community.

6. Turkey's relationships with the EEC have developed through a complex and confusing process which includes economic, social and political implications originating from both sides. The most striking feature of this process of development consists of the various hesitations and anxieties nourished and expressed by different sources, so that the outlook is even more ambiguous and confusing. Turkey should particularly examine and reconsider the full membership of Greece as well as the application of Spain and Portugal to the EEC.

7. In the course of all that debate going on, the adoption of "visa" procedures, first initiated by West Germany and later pursued by several countries of Western Europe is likely to have adverse effects on relations between Turkey and the EEC. Visa requirements are apt to hinder relations between Turkey and the EEC to an extent never encountered before. Their implementation will definitely violate the Roman Treaty as well as the agreements regulating relations of Turkey with the EEC and all other bilateral agreements which Turkey has signed. In short, imposition of "visa" requirements should be interpreted as a move towards the creation of a new Europe which aims to exclude Turkey outside its borders.

### **E — Other Multilateral Relations**

1. As a member, Turkey is attending the committees which have been formed under the structure of the European Council. On the dates of 6th-8th May 1980 in Strasbourg, the subjects of "The integration of migrant workers and their families to the receiving countries" and "the cooperation between the receiving and the sending countries" have been discussed and the following points have been indicated: a) New tendencies have been observed in the nature of the migration movement in Europe. New policies must be implemented to these tendencies. The countries concerned, by considering the demographic developments, have to prepare national policies and bi-or multilateral cooperation patterns in this respect. b) International migration movement in Europe can be considered as ceased, after the restrictive measures taken by receiving countries. When the population of migrant workers grew with the new births every year, the problem of unification of the families and with some humanitarian reasons, the matter of their staying in the receiving countries came forward. Thus, the discussions concerning the related permission have taken place. Furthermore, seasonal and shuttled workers' migrations are still going on. c) Consequently, almost all the members of the second generation are reaching an employable age. Therefore, this necessitates long-run efforts and

cooperation between the sending and the receiving countries. d) For the migrant workers and their families, the migration movement has got a crucial dimension from the humanitarian, economic and social aspects. These workers are expecting to have regulations regarding equality in treatment, health, social security and cultural subjects. e) Employment opportunities for the returning workers must be provided. f) It is necessary to have harmonious relations between the migrant workers and the native population of the receiving country. The efforts for the solution of the integration problems of the migrant workers and their families must be increased, as well as their housing problems, vocational and social developments must be more carefully dealt with. In addition, the migrant workers have to have equal working conditions and their natural rights.

2. The decisions taken regarding the female migrant workers are as follows: a) To give them the necessary information on living and working conditions of the host country, b) To provide the female workers with the courses to teach them to write and read, to learn the language of the host country and enable them to have vocational training opportunities, c) To provide them with the social assistance such as housing, nursery for the children, schools, etc., so that they can adapt themselves to the new social environment more easily.

#### The Relations with O.E.C.D., I.L.O., and U.N.

1. "The research group on migrant workers", functioning under the organizational structure of O.E.C.D. approaches and investigates the problems of migrant workers from a different point of view. In the meeting held on 25th-27th February 1980 in Paris, in which the Turkish representatives were also present, and in the meeting on the employment of female workers, held in April 1980, the matter of equal treatment to female workers as far as their employment and working conditions are concerned, has been emphasized and the

necessity of having new measures for the integration of the wives of the migrant workers have been proposed.

2. The agreements Nrs. 97 and 143, and resolutions Nrs. 86 and 151 of ILO are to be mentioned here. Furthermore, ILO tried to provide the migrant workers with equality in opportunities through the agreement Nr. 143 designed in 1975. The Turkish representatives were present during the preparation of these agreements and signed both of them.

3. United Nations have been conducting various projects on the protection of migrant workers and their families and discussed a new agreement on the same subject during its 35th General Meeting.

### III — THE RETURNING WORKERS AND THEIR REINTEGRATION PROBLEMS

#### A — The Problems Of Returning Workers

##### A General Outlook

1. According to some estimations the number of workers who have returned to their homeland is now well over 300.000. Unfortunately, successive Turkish governments have not appreciated the importance of returnees and therefore, failed to prepare a special policy or even a plan or any measures. The reason may be attributed to the changes of the characteristics of the Turkish Migrant workers.

2. In the beginnig, it was told that the workers will endure to stay for two, maybe three years in foreign countries in order to reach their target income or to fulfill their objectives. The authorities anticipated their return within a relatively short period of time. But the conditions have changed; workers have obtained new target incomes which became very attractive due to the frequent devaluation of the Turkish Lira.

3. On the other hand, unification of the family members in the host country meant breaking the ties with their local

villages or their environment. After a certain period they also start to get accustomed to their new conditions and become involved in their community's affairs.

4. Finally, I would like to point out that "the target workers" in the course of time become permanent workers blessed with indefinite residence. In other words, countries accepting migrant workers and their families expect them to stay and work temporarily but in reality actual development takes deverse direction.

#### Some Characteristics of the Returnees

1. The workers who leave the rural areas do not go back to their original towns; on the contrary they tend to settle in the comperatively well-developed cities of Western Turkey. This is partly due to their desire to carry on their way of living and partly the pressures emanating from the young generation who have brought up in the foreign countries. Educational facilities also play an important role in deciding where to settle.

2. The migrant workers who become a typical example of the industrial labor force and who are employed by the industrial organizations of the host countries tend to display a great desire to set up their own business, workshops or similar establishments on their return to Turkey. But observations show that after a while they usually fail in their new occupations.

3. It seems that a very high percentage of migrant workers could not use their time efficiently. They have learned neither a proper language nor an occupation and they have not benefited from the opportunities of training in the technically advanced countries.

4. The movement of establishing enterprises by the migrant workers, (it can be even called the "Turkish Model" because of the original characteristics it possesses) has lost its meaning and the companies established couldn't get deve-

loped when governments did not support them efficiently. Thus, quite a large number of migrant workers with good intentions who wanted to contribute to the development of their country were lost in the bureaucratic obstacles of the industrialization process.

5. The interesting aspect of the matter is that while the Turkish businessmen were investing in other countries esp. in the Arabic countries and the Turkish migrant workers were trying to establish enterprises with their own resources, the development rate of the country could not reach a satisfactory level.

## **B — Reintegration Problems**

### **Some Practices and Measures**

1. Although Turkey hasn't taken any steps to follow the policies to maximize the contributions of the returning migrant workers to the Turkish economy, as a matter of fact, it has taken many necessary measures to solve their problems upon their return. However, all these measures were far from being the parts of a whole. In other words, they were lacking unity. As far as the other missing points concerned, we can mention the following; there are no official organizations which have to register the returning workers and to assist them indirectly. Secondly, no stable policies in long run are established in this respect.

2. Some of the policies of Turkey, lacking unity, are aiming at the transfer of more savings of the migrant workers to the country, whereas the others are trying to facilitate the procedures and issues related to the migrant workers' visits to Turkey during their annual holidays. As for the most important group of policies, they cover the privileges the workers will benefit when they bring household goods, tools, machines and etc., to Turkey upon their return. This last group of measures also includes the privileges pertaining to the workers' enterprises, loans given to the workers for housing and establishing businesses or workshops.

3. Under the same heading we have many measures which have undergone changes by time. If we want to name some of them; general incentive measures, encouragement of investments, customs duty reductions, payment by installment, loans for housing and establishing businesses and workshops, agricultural loans, DCM (Convertible Turkish Lira Account) and free of charge imports can be mentioned. Free of charge imports contain a set of terms regarding dowry, inheritance, workers' enterprises, facilities provided for cooperatives, projects for the evaluation of small savings. Here we must also add that a bank called DESİYAP (Government, industry, and workers' investments bank) has been established for the financing of the workers' enterprises.

4. Application of higher exchange rates on foreign currency the migrant workers have, removing the bureaucratic obstacles, paying foreign currency instead of actually doing the military service, sales of houses, cars and goods in customs to be paid in foreign currency, allocation of tractors to the workers who send foreign currency regularly to the home country, priority to the investments under the government guarantee, employment opportunities upon return are to be mentioned among the measures taken by the Turkish government in the recent years. Regulations relating to the contractor services especially in the Arabic countries, the transfer of the part of the profit gained abroad by these contractor companies, the establishment of a law on capital market, the sales of plane tickets and their taxes and duties to be paid in foreign currency also constitute a set of complex measures taken in this respect. Beside all these, numerous other measures were also taken in order to settle the problems the workers' enterprises have from the technical and financial aspects.

#### **The Evaluation of Reintegration Policies**

1. As a general tendency, longer the period the migrant worker stays abroad, the intention to return to home country gets weaker. Because during that period the worker can notice



the stagnation in the economic development and the limited employment opportunities in the home country. Unification with the family also effects the worker to change his mind. Sometimes this tendency becomes so strong that the families who were forced to return to home country, after some unpleasant experiences, try to find out the ways to go abroad again.

2. The number of migrant workers whose return dates are getting more invisible and who are probably planing to stay abroad until their retirement age ,is increasing rapidly. This tendency has made the second generation's problems more important than the returning matter.

3. Turkey has not settled down the matter of returning migrant workers with legislative and administrative regulations and at the same time, could not establish the necessary institutions in this respect. For instance, "the workers' returning model" has no organic ties with the workers' enterprises. these entreprises, the returnees are not satisfied with them. Because such opportunities don't fulfill their expectations. In other words; a) A return and reintegration model, based on the workers' enterprises, hasn't been established in a meaningful and efficient manner, b) In case, such a model is is established, the present and the potential development opportunities of the workers' enterprises would be far from providing sufficient job possibilities for the returning workers, c) Consequently, we can say that the returnees who are unwilling to work as industrial workers as far as their income and status concerned, would be share-holders in the workers' enterprises but would refuse to work there as workers. d) When the returning worker fails in a independent business attempt, he then can think of working in a factory as a worker, returning to the rural areas or most probably looking for opportunities to go abroad again.

4. The experiences generally show that when the wife and the husband are unable to go abroad together, upon return the difficulties in adaptation the the environment will be

greater. In such cases we meet the separation of the families and divorces more often. Although the tendency to return to home country is stronger when one of the spouses is living abroad alone, the reintegration problems become more serious.

5. The problems of migrant workers' children have very complex characteristics; their integration is more difficult compared to their parents. However, the Ministry of Education has already developed some principles concerning the education opportunities of these children. In fact, the ministry provides allocations in the primary and secondary boarding schools to the children of migrant workers and inform them of these provisions.

#### Social Change and Reintegration

1. Turkey considers the employment in the foreign countries as a part of the returning process of the workers to their home country. In other words, seeing the Western industrial discipline, Turkey wants to utilize the skilled labor force in its own industrialization. But actually the matter has developed in this manner: Although different sources release different ratios, it has been estimated that nearly 40% of the total migrant workers may be termed as "skilled workers".<sup>15</sup> There is no doubt that skill differentials between emigrants of different nationalities would be difficult to judge. Technological advancement of societies plays an important role in this respect. On the other

15) Pls. see the following sources for the different rates mentioned:

Yüksel, A.S.; Ortak Pazarın Sosyal Düzeni ve Ortak Pazarla İlişkilerimizin Sanayimiz Açısından Sosyal Yapıya Muhtemel Etkileri (The Social Order of the EEC and its Probable Impact on the Social Structure vis-a-vis the Industry), Ankara, 1973, p. 57.

Abadan, Unat, N. - Keleş, R. - Penninx, R. - Renselaar, H.V.; Migration and Development, Ankara, 1978, p. 22.

Dışişleri Bakanlığı (Ministry of Foreign Affairs); Yurt - dışı Göç Hareketleri ve Vatandaş Sorunları (Foreign Migration and Problems of Citizens), Ankara, 1973, pp. 14-15.

hand, complexity of this problem increases as the workers tend to register themselves in the occupations which they think will give them better job opportunities. But on their arrival, they work in different occupations. This happens on a much greater scale after returning to Turkey where they start working in totally different areas. For example, as taxi drivers, owners of small business enterprises or grocery stores.

2. The main purpose of the migrant worker, by considering the social security system prevailing in Turkey, is to achieve a way of living without working dependently and being forced to return to his old status. Therefore, when the migrant workers visit their home land during their annual holidays, they try to own land, shops, vehicles for commercial use and other durable properties which will enable them to be their own bosses. As one writer correctly states "in the old days the ambition of a worker was to own a few acres of land and a sufficient number of oxen. But today he wishes to build a shanty and then to own a minibuss and finally to buy a private car and a flat in a residential area."

#### General Tendencies and Conclusion

We can summarize the problems regarding the welfare of migrant workers and their families from the aspects of legislative and administrative regulations as follows:

1. To formulate the long-range policies, the problem of labor migration should be analysed multilaterally and in depth. Emphasis should be placed particularly on such issues as solving their welfare problems in the host country and employment policies and measures aimed at reinforcing the social and economic relationships of workers abroad with the homeland, strengthening their propensity for repatriation, resolving their economic and social problems upon return and especially increasing their contribution to the country's development efforts through their re-employment at home.

2. Within the course of time, major changes have occurred in Turkey's approach to existing problems. Initially, worker migration was considered to have a favorable impact on the unemployment pressure at home. However, following the 1973 oil crisis, an important turning point emerged in the area of foreign employment opportunities.

3. But recently, the number of migrant workers has shown a slight increase because of the labor exportation to the Arabic countries. Needless to say that from Turkey's point of view, it is impossible to compare the present, and future potentials of the Arabic countries with the North European countries.

4. The most important factor strengthening the tendencies towards this direction has been the fast decline in the interest towards employment questions with an increasing interest in the workers' remittances in foreign exchange. These workers' remittances and the increase in the amount of foreign exchange sent home have certainly had great favorable impact in the acute foreign exchange deficit of the developing Turkish economy.

5. On the other hand, it is important to note that migration never will be an employment policy for Turkey. Statistics indicate the number of workers who enter the labor market in Turkey in each year is equivalent to the total number of exported manpower during the last twenty years. Therefore, the magnitude of this problem is very important for the future shape of Turkish economy and society as a whole.

6. While Turkey's present policies differ in short and long run, there is no doubt that they aim at sending the surplus of labor to the foreign countries and solving the problems which the migrant workers face with, while they are working and living, with the legislative and administrative regulations.

7. While evaluating the migration movement from the Turkish viewpoint the most important factor to be considered is that this movement is the most serious event of the republican era with its economic and social aspects. Actually the

migration of Turkish workers to the foreign countries is a part of the urbanization process Turkey has experienced.

8. Turkey has undergone a radical change from rural to urban regions, from traditional to modern and from agricultural to industrial or service sectors rapidly. In this change process, modernization effected by the migration to the foreign countries appears in the urban structure. The quality of education becomes higher depending on the income level. While the population growth rate decreases, the society gets a balanced structure for the economic and social development.

9. This migration movement has an important place in the process of change in Turkey. In spite of its importance, it cannot be said that this movement has been evaluated in a sufficient manner. The basic skill here is to evaluate the movement first by forecasting and then placing it within the organizational and legislative regulations which will contribute to the development of the country.

10. When the migration movement has first come out, Turkey could not organize the necessary regulations on time. As a matter of fact, in case of such a migration movement, what is required is to follow the recruitment and sending strategies in compliance with the country's own development policies.

11. The problems relating to the migration of the Turkish workers to the foreign countries weren't only faced during the recruitment phase of the cycle. The problems met while the workers were living and working in foreign countries and upon their return to the home country continued to increase in various dimensions.

12. The preferences relating to the horizontal or the vertical advantages that the sending country expects to have, must be clearly determined. The rotation, integration, reintegration and the assimilation practices must be assessed within the framework of the sending country's preferences.

In other words, they shouldn't be left to the choice of the receiving country.

13. Although Turkey has handled the matter of migration with the bilateral agreements and relationships with EEC as well as with the legislative and administrative regulations created by the national legislation, the expected results in this respect couldn't be reached. The migration movement which was carried out by bilateral agreements for many years, could never be considered as a movement which was to be regulated with the social policies of EEC.

14. Among the countries sending labor force to the Northern Europe, although Turkey designs more policies and original models for the integration and development of its migrant workers and their families, because of the inconsistency and uncertainty of these policies, the relevant measures taken turned into a chaos.

15. We also note that the legislative and administrative regulations relating to the migrant workers and their families have a dynamic character in course of time. For example, instead of the problems of the first generation in the early experiences, we now have the problems of the second and even the third generation. It is doubtless that with the efficient organizations and strategies, the problems of the migration movement will be solved and it will become a process of accelerating the rate of development.

16. We can summarize the legislative and the administrative regulations as follows: a) The recruitment processes must be rationalized by the reorganization of the Labor Office. b) The migrant workers must be provided with some information about the working and living conditions of the receiving country. c) Before leaving the home country, the migrant workers must have a training program to improve their vocational skills and also must be given some information about the culture of the receiving country. d) The Labor Office must carry on the functions of reintegrating and finding new employment opportunities in the industrial and service

sectors for the returnees. e) The workers' enterprises must be reorganized so that this movement will not be a waste of foreign currency but will serve for the development and reintegration purposes. f) The legislative and administrative regulations must be arranged in order to strengthen the social and cultural relations of the migrant workers with their home country and to solve the problems they face with when they are abroad. g) The necessary measures must be taken to enable the migrant Turkish workers and their families to benefit from the economic and social opportunities emerging from the bilateral and multilateral agreements and from the laws of the country they are working and living in. h) In our modern world to preserve the human dignity in working life, basic needs such as the unification of the families, the solution of the second generations problems, benefiting from the health and housing opportunities, and having equal opportunities in education have to be fulfilled.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

- ABADAN, UNAT, N. - KELEŞ, R. - PENNINX, R. - RENSEAAS, H.V.; **Migration and Development**, Ankara, 1976.
- ANDERSON, Leona, M.; **Turkish Emigrant Workers in Germany**, Senior Seminar in Foreign Policy, Department of State, Washington, D.C., 1973-1974.
- AVRUPA TOPLULUĞU DERGİSİ (EC Review), **Avrupa'da Sosyal Politikalar** (Social Policies in Europe), Nr. 15, pp. 24-28.
- BARROWCLIFF, G. - PUYVELDE, E.V.; **Göçmen İşçiler ve Avrupa Topluluğu** (Migrant Workers and the EEC), Avrupa Topluluğu Dergisi, (EC Review), Nr. 14, pp. 13-20.
- BOHNING, W.R.; **Future Demand for Migrant Workers in Western Europe**, Geneva, 1976.
- BONN BÜYÜKELÇİLİĞİ (Turkish Embassy in Bonn), **F. Almanya İşgücü Piyasası ve F. Almanya'daki Türk El Emegi** (Labour Market and the Turkish Manual Labour in W. Germany), Ankara, 1976.
- COMMISSION OF THE EC; **Action Programme in Favour of Migrant Workers and their Families**, Brussels, 1974.
- COMMISSION OF THE EC; **Illegal Immigration**, Brussels, 1975.
- COMMISSION OF THE EC; **Implementation of Article 17 of the EEC - Turkey Association Agreement Concerning Freedom of Movement of Workers**, Brussels, 1976.
- ÇALIŞMA BAKANLIĞI (Ministry of Labour), **Yurt Dışı İşçi Sorunları Genel Müdürlüğü 1980 Yılı Çalışma Raporu**, (General Directory of the Foreign Labour Problems; Annual Action Report, 1980), Ankara, 1980.
- DPT (State Planning Organization) **Kalkınma Planı I, II, III, IV** (Five Years Development Plans I, II, III, IV, Ankara).
- DIŞİŞLERİ BAKANLIĞI (Ministry of Foreign Affairs) **Yurt - dışı Göç Hareketleri ve Vatandaş Sorunları** (Foreign Migration and Problems of Citizens), Ankara, 1973.



- EGE, Ünal; **Yurt Dışında Çalışanların Sorunları** (Problems of Migrant Turkish Workers), Ankara, 1981, (mimeo).
- EKİN, N.; **Turkish Labour in the EEC**, Die Türkei auf dem Weg in the EG. Möglichkeiten und Probleme einer Vollmitgliedschaft der Türkei in der Europäischen Gemeinschaft, R. Oldenbourg Verlag, München - Wien, 1979, pp. 77-78.
- EKİN, N.; **AET Ülkelerinde Çalışan Türk İşçilerinin Sorunları** (Problems of the Turkish Workers Employed in the EEC Countries), Türkiye AET İlişkileri, İktisadi Araştırmalar Vakfı, İstanbul, 1977, pp. 149-188.
- EKİN, N.; **Labour Force and Employment Problems in Turkey**, Problems of Turkey's Economic Development, Vol. I, İstanbul, 1978, pp. 463-481.
- EKİN, N.; **Structure of Labour Force : Turkey**, Intereconomics, Oct. 1973, pp. 316-318.
- EKİN, N.; **Yurt Dışı İşgücü İstihdamının Ekonomik ve Sosyal Analizi**, (Economic and Social Analysis of the Employment of Foreign Labour), İktisat Fakültesi Dergisi (Review of Faculty of Economics), Vol. 30, Nr. 1-4, pp. 73-96.
- EKİN, N.; **Batı Ülkelerinde Çalışan Türk İşçilerinin Tasarruflarının Değerlendirilmesi ve İşçi Şirketleri** (Evaluation of the Savings of Turkish Workers Employed Abroad and Workers Corporations, Cumhuriyetin 50. Yılında Türkiye'nin Sosyal ve Ekonomik Sorunları Semineri, (Seminar Notes), Erzurum, 1973, pp. 61-79.
- EKİN, N.; **Die Wirtschaftliche Entwicklung und die Aussenhandelsbeziehungen der Türkei**, Die Dritte Welt, Jahrgang 6, Nr. 3-4, 1978, pp. 503-527.
- EKİN, N.; **Ortak Pazarda Çalışma Meseleleri ve Türkiye** (Labour Problems in the EEC and Turkey), Sosyal Siyaset Konferansları, XVIII. Kitap, pp. 279-314.
- EKİN, N.; **Problems of Turkish Workers with Respect of Turkey - EEC Relations**, International Conference, Options for Turkey's International Economic and Political Relations", İstanbul, June 28-30, 1979, pp. 1-15.
- EKİN, N.; **Migration and Reintegration Problems of Turkish Workers**, European - American Workshop on the Security of Turkey and its Allies : Self Development and Interdependence, İstanbul, 10-12 September 1979, pp. 1-28.

- EKİN, N.; **Some Aspects of the Turkish Economic and Social Development**; Problems of Turkey's Economic Development, Vol. II, ELO Matbaası, İstanbul, 1979, pp. 21-42.
- EUROPEAN COMMUNITIES; **Freedom of Movement for Workers within the Community**, Brussels, 1972.
- EUROPEAN COMMUNITIES; **Turkey - EEC Relation 1963-1977**, Ankara, 1977.
- EEC - TURKEY JOINT PARLIAMENTARY COMMITTEE; **Background Information for the Report on Problems Connected with the School Education of the Children of Turkish Workers in the Countries of the EC**, Brussels, 1975.
- GEVGİLİLİ, A.; **Dıştaki İşçiler ve Sivil Toplum** (Migrant Workers and Civilian Society), Milliyet Gazetesi, 4.8.1979.
- GITMEZ, A.S.; **Return Migration of Turkish Workers; Effects and Implications for Policy**, METU, Ankara, 1977.
- İŞ VE İŞÇİ BULMA KURUMU GENEL MÜDÜRLÜĞÜ (General Directory of Employment Office) F. **Almanya Çalışma Bakanlığı 72 Örnekleme Araştırması : Almanya'da Çalışan Yabancı İşçilerin İstihdam, Aile ve İkamet Sorunları** (W. Germany Ministry of Labour 72 Sampling Research : Foreign Workers Employment, Family and Housing Problems in Germany), Ankara, 1974.
- KINDLEBERGER, C.P.; **Göç, Büyüme ve Gelişme** (Migration, Growth and Development), Avrupa Dergisi, No. 34, Eylül, -978, pp. 77-11.
- KUYUMCU, T.; **AET'de İşçilerin Serbest Dolaşımı** (Free Movement of Workers within the EEC), İstanbul, 1976.
- MILLER, D. - ÇETİN, İ.; **Migrant Workers, Wages and Labor Markets**, İstanbul Üniversitesi, İktisat Fakültesi, İstanbul, 1954.
- MILLER, Duncan, R.; **Emigrant Turkish Workers - A Framework for Analysis, Studies in Development**, Nr. 3, Fall 1971, Middle East Technical University, pp. 529-541.
- PENNINX, R. - RENSELAAR, H.V.; **A Fortune in Small Change**. The Hague, 1978.
- POPULATION CRISIS COMMITTEE; **Labour Force Growth, Unemployment and Migration Population**, No. 7, Sept. 1977.
- REİSOĞLU, S.; **Türk İşçileri Yönünden Ortak Pazar Ülkelerinde Serbest İşçi Dolaşımı** (Free Movement of Turkish Workers in EEC Countries), TÜTİS Dergisi, Cilt 3, Sayı 3-4, pp. 3-7.

**SUDOSTEUROPE - GESELLSCHAFT; 350.000 Türkenkinder in Deutschland, München, 1977.**

**TÖRÜNER, M.; Labour Movements in the European Economic Community; Economic Relations Between Turkey and the SEC, Ankara, 1978, pp. 456-481.**

**TÜRK - İŞ DERGİSİ (Türk - İş Confederation of Labour Review), Almanya'da Türk İşçileri : Alman İşçi Sendikaları Konfederasyonu Araştırması (Turkish Workers in W. Germany : German Trade Union Confederation Research), Nr. 113, Haziran 1974.**

**YAŞER, B.; Some Thoughts on the Impact of Remittances from Turkish Workers Abroad, Ankara, 1974.**

**YÜKSEL, A.S.; Ortak Pazarın Sosyal Düzeni ve Ortak Pazarla İlişkilerimizin Sanayimiz Açısından Sosyal Yapıya Muhtemel Etkileri (The Social Order of the EEC and its Probable Impact on the Social Structure, vis-a-vis the Industry), Ankara, 1973.**

